

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL AGENDA



Monday 8th October 2007

at 10.00 a.m.

**in the Blue Room, Avondale Centre,
Dyke House, Hartlepool
(Raby Road entrance)**

MEMBERS: CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL:

Councillors Fleming, Flintoff, Simmons, Sutheran and Wallace

- 1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**
- 2. TO RECEIVE ANY DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST BY MEMBERS**
- 3. MINUTES**
 - 3.1 To confirm the minutes of the meeting held on 24th September 2007 (*to follow*)
- 4. ITEMS FOR INFORMATION**
 - 4.1 Tender Opening – Grayfields Sports Pitches Improvement Works (Contract Ref no 226 (as retained from the Original Tender)) – *Director of Adult and Community Services and Director of Neighbourhood Services*
 - 4.2 Central Hartlepool Housing Regeneration Financial Modelling and Implementation Framework Commission – Appointment of Consultants – *Director of Regeneration and Planning Services*
- 5. ANY OTHER ITEMS WHICH THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS ARE URGENT**
- 6. LOCAL GOVERNMENT (ACCESS TO INFORMATION) ACT 1985**

EXEMPT ITEMS

Under Section 100(A)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following items of business on the grounds that it involves the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in the paragraph 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985

7. OPENING OF TENDERS

7.1 War Memorial – Victory Square (235) – *Building Consultancy Manager*

8. ANY OTHER CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS WHICH THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS ARE URGENT

ITEMS FOR INFORMATION

i) **Date of Next Meeting Monday 22nd October 2007 commencing at 10.00am in the Blue Room, Avondale Centre, Dyke House.**

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL

8th October 2007



Report of: The Director of Adult and Community Services
and The Director of Neighbourhood Services

Subject: Tender Opening: Grayfields Sports Pitches
Improvement Works (Contract Ref. No. 226 (as
retained from the original tender))

1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

To inform the panel of the requirement to re-tender the Grayfields Sports Pitches Improvement Works following revisions to the schedule as a result of the high value of the initial tender sums.

2. BACKGROUND

This programme of works has been developed with the client, HBC Parks & Countryside, and is to be funded by the authority. Improvement works were to be undertaken in two phases to allow for continued partial use of the pitches over 2007-2008 and 2008-2009. This has been altered to a single phase of works to reduce costs. Tenders are to be returned for opening at Scrutiny Panel on 8th October 2007. Tender packages have been re-issued to the three constructors currently on HBC's lists of approved contractors who are accredited by SAPCA, the Sports and Play Construction Association. SAPCA is the UK trade association for specialist sports facility construction and gives assurances that contractors are competent to construct specialist sports facilities and surfaces. Costs for these works are expected to be in the region of £160,000.

The works consist of earthworks to regrade and level the pitches and the complete re-seeding of the area with an appropriate grass seed mix recommended for sports pitches. Associated drainage works are also proposed in order to improve the use of the pitch during a greater part of the season. Rationalisation of the footpath related to the remains of the previous running track and the former pavilion site will also be undertaken.

3. PROPOSALS

Given the value of these works being in excess of the £45,000 limit associated with quotations, the process of tendering has been undertaken to

procure the implementation of the scheme. Three contractors have expressed interest in these works and have previously tendered for the work. These are John Hellens Contractors Ltd, Brambledown Landscape Services and Cleveland Land Services.

4. RECOMMENDATIONS

That all tenders received before the deadline date are opened at the subsequent meeting.

5. REASONS FOR RECOMMENDATIONS

All tendering contractors have been vetted and approved by HBC in order to be placed on approved lists of contractors. All tendering contractors are also SAPCA approved (the appropriate industry standard of accreditation) and also have appropriate experience of undertaking similar work for the authority.

6. CONTACT OFFICER

Steven Wilkie
Landscape Architecture Team Leader
Neighbourhood Services
Building Consultancy
Hartlepool Borough Council
01429 523475
steven.wilkie@hartlepool.gov.uk

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL

8th October 2007



Report of: The Director of Regeneration and Planning Services

Subject: CENTRAL HARTLEPOOL HOUSING
REGENERATION FINANCIAL MODELLING AND
IMPLEMENTATION FRAMEWORK COMMISSION-
APPOINTMENT OF CONSULTANTS

1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 To update the panel on the appointment of consultants to undertake the Central Hartlepool Housing Regeneration Financial Modelling and Implementation Framework Commission and to advise of the successful tenderer.

2. BACKGROUND

- 2.1 The Contract Scrutiny Panel on 28th August 2007 agreed to the recommendation that 8 consultants who submitted pre-qualification questionnaires should be issued with a full project brief due to their range of experience in carrying out similar work. This took place and six full tender submissions were received by the deadline of the 5th September 2007 at 12noon and were opened and recorded by the Panel at its meeting on Monday 10th September 2007.

3. PROPOSALS

- 3.1 After analysis of the full tender submissions, four consultants were short listed for interview based on their ability to complete the work in the tight timescale and the proposals set out in their submission under the five key areas of work. The four short listed consultants which were Deloitte/NLP/Dickinson Dees, DTZ/PWC/ Dickinson Dees, Grant Thornton and Tribal Consulting, were invited to give a presentation and answer four pre-set questions. The interview panel consisted of 2 Council officers and two Housing Hartlepool officers. Each consultant was marked on presentation and questions and those marks were entered into a score matrix. References for each were also requested and evaluated within the

matrix. The score was based on a 60% performance/ 40% price ratio. The matrix demonstrates and it was agreed by all officers that Delloitte/NLP/Dickenson Dees presented the best overall package and they were appointed on the 14th September 2007. The score matrix is attached for information as **Appendix 1**.

4. RECOMMENDATIONS

- 4.1 That the Panel note the decision to appoint Delloitte/NLP/Dickinson Dees to undertake the Central Hartlepool Housing Regeneration Financial Modelling and Implementation Framework Commission.

5. REASONS FOR RECOMMENDATIONS

- 5.1 The price/performance score matrix demonstrates that Delloitte/NLP/Dickinson Dees submitted the successful tender based a higher score at interview, references and a competitive price.

6. CONTACT OFFICER

Amy Waters
Planning Officer
Department of Regeneration and Planning
Planning Policy Section
Hartlepool Borough Council
01429 523539
amy.waters@hartlepool.gov.uk

4.2 APPENDIX 1

**Central Hartlepool Housing Regeneration Financial
Modelling and Implementation Framework Commission**

Price/Performance Score Matrix

:

Date 27/09/2007

Category	References			Presentation & Interview			Pricing/ highest price			Total
Name of Contractor Weight	Score from Questionnaire	% of Highest Score	Best Value Score mark out of 10	Score from Interview Matrix	% of Highest Score	Best Value Score mark out of 50	Price for completion Of all brief Requirements	% of Lowest Price	Best Value Score mark out of 40	mark out of 100
Deloitte/NLP/ Dickenson Dees	80.08	88.9	8.8	37	100	50	£49,043	100	40	98.8
DTZ/PWC /Dickenson Dees	88	97.8	9.7	37	100	50	£76,240	62.76	25.1	84.8
Tribal Consulting	0	0	0	33	89.2	44.6	£54,250	73.54	29.42	74.02
Grant Thornton UK	90	100	10	32	86.5	43.25	£61,350	70.11	28.04	81.29

Completed By:

Signed

Agreed By:

Signed
