

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL AGENDA



Monday 22nd October 2007

at 10.00 a.m.

**in the Yellow Room, Avondale Centre,
Dyke House, Hartlepool
(Raby Road entrance)**

MEMBERS: CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL:

Councillors Fleming, Flintoff, Simmons, Sutheran and Wistow

- 1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**
- 2. TO RECEIVE ANY DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST BY MEMBERS**
- 3. MINUTES**
 - 3.1 To confirm the minutes of the meeting held on 8th October 2007
- 4. ITEMS FOR INFORMATION**
 - 4.1 Development of an Integrated Commissioning Strategy for the Children and Young People's Strategic Partnership – *Director of Children's Services*
 - 4.2 Results of Tender for Hartlepool Southern Business Zone – Feasibility study – *Director of Regeneration and Planning Services*
- 5. ANY OTHER ITEMS WHICH THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS ARE URGENT**
- 6. LOCAL GOVERNMENT (ACCESS TO INFORMATION) ACT 1985**

EXEMPT ITEMS

Under Section 100(A)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following items of business on the grounds that it involves the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in the paragraph 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985

7. OPENING OF TENDERS

- 7.1 Children's Centre at Kingsley Primary School (238) – *Senior Quantity Surveyor*
- 7.2 Central Area Investment Framework (230) – *Senior Regeneration Officer*

8. ANY OTHER CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS WHICH THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS ARE URGENT

ITEMS FOR INFORMATION

- i) **Date of Next Meeting Monday 5th November 2007 commencing at 10.00am in the Red Room, Avondale Centre, Dyke House.**

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL

MINUTES AND DECISION RECORD

8th October 2007

The meeting commenced at 10.00 a.m. in the Avondale Centre, Hartlepool

PRESENT: Bob Flintoff (In the Chair);
Councillors Chris Simmons and Lilian Sutheran

Also Present in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 4.2(ii);
Councillor Michelle Plant as substitute for Councillor Timothy Fleming

OFFICERS: Peter Devlin, Legal Services Manager
Colin Bolton, Building Consultancy Manager
Paul Jamieson, Trainee Landscape Architect
Jo Wilson, Democratic Services Officer

48. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Councillor Timothy Fleming

49. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

None

50. MINUTES OF THE MEETINGS HELD ON 24th SEPTEMBER 2007 AND 2nd OCTOBER 2007

Agreed

51. TENDER OPENING – GRAYFIELDS SPORTS PITCHES IMPROVEMENT WORKS (CONTRACT REF NO 226 (AS RETAINED FROM THE ORIGINAL TENDER)) – *Director of Adult and Community Services and Director of Neighbourhood Services*

Members were advised that this programme of works had been developed with the client, HBC Parks and Countryside, and was to be funded by the authority. Improvement works were to be undertaken in two phases to allow for continued partial use of the pitches between 2007 and 2009. This had been altered to a single phase of works to reduce costs. Tender packages had been re-issued to the three constructors currently on the list of approved contractors accredited by the Sports and

Play Construction Associaton. Costs were expected to be in the region of £160,000

Decision

That the tenders received in advance of the deadline date be opened.

52. CENTRAL HARTLEPOOL HOUSING REGENERATION FINANCIAL MODELLING AND IMPLEMENTATION OF FRAMEWORK COMMISSION – APPOINTMENT OF CONSULTANTS – *Director of Regeneration and Planning Services*

On 10th September 2007 six tender submissions for the appointment of consultants to undertake the Central Hartlepool Housing Regeneration Financial Modelling and Implementation Framework Commission were opened and recorded by the Contract Scrutiny Panel. After analysis of the submissions four consultants were shortlisted for interview based on their ability to complete the work in the tight timescale and proposals set out in the submission under the five key areas of work. The four short listed consultants were invited to give a presentation and answer pre-set questions. Each consultant was marked on presentation and questions and those marks entered into a score matrix. Reference were also requested and evaluated within the matrix. The score was based on a 60:40 performance:price ratio. Following this process it was agreed that Deloitte/NLP/Dickenson Dees presented the best overall package and they were appointed on 14th September 2007.

Members raised a number of queries in relation to the appointment of the consultants and how the final decision had been reached. It was noted that there was nobody in attendance able to expertly answer the relevant questions. Members requested that the officer concerned be invited to a future meeting of the Panel to advise on how the work was proceeding. The Chair requested that the existing members of the Contract Scrutiny Panel be present at that time.

Decision

That the report be noted

53. LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACCESS TO INFORMATION

Under Section 100(A)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the press and public were excluded from the meeting for the following item of business on the grounds that it involved the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in paragraph 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) Order 2006.

Minute 54 – Grayfields Sports Pitches Improvement Works (Ref: 226) (para 3 - information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (including the authority holding that information)).

Minute 55 – War Memorial – Victory Square (Ref: 235) (para 3 - information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (including the authority holding that information)).

54. GRAYFIELDS SPORTS PITCHES IMPROVEMENT WORKS (REF: 226) – Director of Adult and Community Services and Director of Neighbourhood Services

Members were informed that tenders had been received in respect of the above project.

55. WAR MEMORIAL – VICTORY SQUARE (REF: 235) – Building Consultancy Manager

Members were informed that tenders had been received in respect of the above project.

R FLINTOFF

CHAIRMAN

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL

22nd October 2007



Report of: Director of Children's Services

Subject: DEVELOPMENT OF AN INTEGRATED
COMMISSIONING STRATEGY FOR THE CHILDREN
AND YOUNG PEOPLE'S STRATEGIC
PARTNERSHIP

1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

To inform the Contract Scrutiny Panel of the development of a joint planning and integrated commissioning strategy for the Children and Young People's Strategic Partnership (CYPSP) and an exception to Contract Procedure rules granted by the Children's Services Portfolio Holder on 4 September 2007, to advance this work.

2. BACKGROUND

- 2.1 Integrated Commissioning is an important part of the Government's *Every Child Matters: Change for Children* agenda, through which the lives of children, families and young people can be improved.
- 2.2 The Children and Young People's Strategic Partnership (CYPSP) will develop a clear workable approach to joint planning and integrated commissioning. To take this important work forward, the Office for Public Management (OPM) will lead a short project with Partnership members and other senior managers to establish a model for integrated commissioning for children, young people and families in Hartlepool.

3. PROPOSALS

- 3.1 OPM is an employee owned, public-interest company. OPM have a wealth of experience in this field and have been employed by the Department for Children, Schools and Families (DCSF) and the Improvement and Development Agency (IDEA) to deliver and report on, a series of developmental seminars on integrated commissioning. Their employees are amongst the country's leading authors in relation to integrated children's commissioning.

- 3.2 The cost of this project, which will take approximately six days (four days on site and two for preparation and writing the final terms of reference for the CYPSP as a commissioning partnership), will be in the region of £10,000 including expenses and Value Added Tax.
- 3.3 The Council's Contract Procedure Rules for contracts between £5,000 and £20,000 require that three Quotations should be obtained wherever possible. However, Part A1(ii) Application of Contract Procedure Rules state that...*'these rules do not apply to contracts with professional persons or contractors for the execution of works or the provision of services in which the professional knowledge and skill of these persons or contractors is of the primary importance...'*

An exception to standard Contract Procedure rules was authorised by the Children's Services Portfolio Holder on 4 September 2007 allowing the local authority to procure the expert services of the Office for Public Management.

4. RECOMMENDATIONS

The Contract Scrutiny Panel is being asked to note:

- 4.1 The development of a joint planning and integrated commissioning strategy for the Children and Young Persons Strategic Partnership;
- 4.2 The exception to the Council's Contract Procedure Rules granted by the Children's Services Portfolio Holder on 4 September 2007.

5. REASONS FOR RECOMMENDATIONS

- 5.1 To make the Contract Scrutiny Panel aware of this project and the exception to the Council's Contract Procedure Rules granted by the Children's Services Portfolio Holder on 4 September 2007.

6. BACKGROUND PAPERS

- 6.1 "Development of an Integrated Commissioning Strategy for the Children and Young Persons Strategic Partnership" – Children's Services Portfolio Report, 4th September 2007.

7. CONTACT OFFICER

Ian Merritt
Head of Commissioning and Children's Partnership
Children's Services
Level 3
Civic Centre
Telephone – 523 774
E-mail – Ian.Merritt@hartlepool.gov.uk

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL

22nd October, 2007



Report of: Director of Regeneration & Planning Services

Subject: RESULTS OF TENDER FOR HARTLEPOOL
SOUTHERN BUSINESS ZONE – FEASIBILITY STUDY

1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 To inform members of the panel of the decision made regarding appointing consultants for undertaking the Hartlepool Southern Business Zone – Feasibility Study tender.

2. BACKGROUND

- 2.1 Members were informed at the meeting of this Panel on Monday 13th August of the intention to go out to tender for undertaking the Hartlepool Southern Business Zone – Feasibility Study.
- 2.2 The need for the Feasibility Study was identified to facilitate the development and enhancement of Hartlepool's key employment generating zone to assist in the long term restructuring of Hartlepool's economy.
- 2.3 The overall project will be delivered through a staged process that will need to start with the commissioning of a comprehensive study to identify the underlying issues in more detail, development of strategy and implementation plan, feasibility of the plan, detailed cost plan and phased implementation plan.
- 2.4 Because of the specialist nature of the work, a total of 13 major UK Regeneration and Economic Development consultant companies were invited to tender who were identified as having the necessary skills and capabilities to delivering this study.

- 2.5 All received tenders were opened at the meeting of Contract Scrutiny Panel on Monday 13th September 2007. A total of three companies submitted proposals for undertaking the study that were Ecotec, Nathaniel Lichfield & Partners and Entec.

3. PROPOSALS

- 3.1 A Panel to score, interview and appoint the consultants was set up that consisted of members from the strategic partnership set up to manage this project. The partnership consists of Hartlepool Borough Council, who will lead on the project, private sector businesses that represent the local interests, Hartlepool Economic Forum and regeneration bodies TVR and ONE North East.
- 3.2 The tender submissions were scored on Tuesday 25th September 2007 by members of this Panel and interviews of all three companies were held on 8th October 2007.
- 3.3 A decision was made on the basis of quality (70%) and price (30%) of the submissions received and as can be seen from the scoring matrix below the score results were very tight and the highest score was 93%.
- 3.4 The Panel therefore have awarded the contract to Ecotec as a result of the highest score achieved.

4. RECOMMENDATION

- 4.1 That members of the panel note the award of the Hartlepool Southern Business Zone – Feasibility Study contract to Ecotec.

5. CONTACT OFFICER

Antony Steinberg
Economic Development Manager
Regeneration & Planning Services
(01429) 523503
antony.steinberg@hartlepool.gov.uk

CONTRACT

:

Hartlepool Southern Business Zone - Feasibility Study**SCORESHEET FOR PRICE/PERFORMANCE (30/70)****DATE:** 08/10/07

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k
Category	Submission			Presentation & Interview	Pricing					Total
Name of Contractor	Score from Matrix	% of Highest Score	Best Value Score % of	Score from Interview Matrix	% of Highest Score	Best Value Score % of	Total Theroretical Price	% of Lowest Price	Best Value Score % of	%
Weight			35%			35%			30%	
ECOTEC	451	100	35.0%	328	100	35.0%	£99,815	76	22.9%	93%
NLP	432	96	33.5%	271	83	28.9%	£80,630	100	30.0%	92%
ENTEC	436	97	33.8%	212	65	22.6%	£90,370	88	26.4%	83%
	451	= highest score		328	= highest score		£80,630	= lowest price		