

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL AGENDA



Monday 19th December 2005

at 11:00 am

in Committee Room 'A'

MEMBERS: CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL:

Councillors Clouth, Dr. Morris, C. Richardson, Rayner and Rogan

- 1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**
- 2. TO RECEIVE ANY DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST BY MEMBERS**
- 3. MINUTES**
 - 3.1 To confirm the minutes of the meeting held on 5th December, 2005 (attached)
- 4. ITEMS FOR INFORMATION**
 - 4.1 Enhancements to Brougham Enterprise Centre – *Head of Procurement and Property Services*
 - 4.2 Central Attractors Capital Improvement Scheme – *Acting Assistant Director (Community Services)*
- 5. ITEMS FOR DECISION**
 - 5.1 None
- 6. ANY OTHER ITEMS WHICH THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS ARE URGENT**
- 7. LOCAL GOVERNMENT (ACCESS TO INFORMATION) ACT 1985**

EXEMPT ITEMS

Under Section 100(A)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following items of business on the grounds that it involves the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in the paragraphs referred to below of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985

8. ITEMS FOR INFORMATION

8.1 None

9. OPENING OF TENDERS

9.1 Tenders in Respect of Central Attractors Capital Improvement Scheme - (para 9) – *Acting Assistant Director (Community Services)*

10. ANY OTHER CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS WHICH THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS ARE URGENT

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL

MINUTES AND DECISION RECORD

5th December 2005

PRESENT: Councillor Pat Rayner (In the Chair);
Councillors: Dr George Morris, Carl Richardson

OFFICERS: Dave Wilson, Principal Engineer
John Jones, Workshop Manager
Jan Bentley, Democratic Services Officer

75. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

None

76. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

None

77. MURRAY STREET ENVIRONMENTAL IMPROVEMENT WORKS – CONTRACTOR SELECTION – *Director of Neighbourhood Services*

To advise the Panel of the outcome of the Contractor appointment process for the above Contract.

Members were informed that at the meeting of the Culture, Housing and Transportation Portfolio Holder held on 13 July 2005, approval had been given for the procurement of a Contractor for the above Works using a quality/cost assessment process with a 80/20 quality/cost weighting.

Contractors had been taken from the Highways select list of Contractors and had been invited to complete a questionnaire and submit cost information for use in the assessment process. Two of the Contractors had declined the invitation and at the Panel meeting held on 7 November 2005, submissions were opened from the following remaining three Contractors (in alphabetical order):

Hall Construction Services Ltd (from Rushyford)
Hartlepool Borough Council Direct Service Organisation
Seymour Civil Engineering Contractors Ltd (from Hartlepool)

The Contractors were interviewed on 18 November by a panel comprising of Officers representing the Client, Engineer and the Well Being Team.

One of the Contractors submitted their cost information late and directly to Officers. The late information had been included in the scores below but the inclusion had not affected the outcome of the scoring process.

The scoring of the Contractors was as follows:

Contractor	Quality Score	Cost Score	Overall Score (weighted)
A	71	100	77
B	74	85	76
C	66	98	72

The Contractor with the highest score - Hall Construction from Rushyford had been appointed for the Scheme.

DECISION

That the outcome of the process be noted with approval.

78. LOCAL GOVERNMENT (ACCESS TO INFORMATION) ACT 1985

Under Section 100(A)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following items of business on the grounds that it involves the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in the paragraphs referred to below of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985

Minute 79 – Tender for Tyres and Tubes – *Director of Neighbourhood Services* (para 9) exempt information under 12A Local Government Act 1972 namely terms proposed or to be proposed by or to the Authority in the course of negotiations for a contract for the acquisition or disposal of property or the supply of goods or services

79. TENDER FOR TYRES AND TUBES – *Director of Neighbourhood Services (para 9)*

To advise members of the decision to award the Tender for Tyres and Tubes to be fitted to Hartlepool Borough Council's Vehicle fleet.

P RAYNER

CHAIRMAN

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL

19th December 2005



Report of: Head of Procurement and Property Services

Subject: ENHANCEMENTS TO BROUGHAM ENTERPRISE CENTRE

1 PURPOSE OF REPORT

To advise members of the outcome of the selection of contractors for this project.

2 BACKGROUND

The Regeneration and Liveability Portfolio Holder agreed that this project should be procured using a partnering approach.

Six contractors were invited to tender and to submit lists of clients from the last two years from which references could be obtained. Three contractors submitted lists, references were obtained and these three contractors were invited to attend for interview on 17th November 2005. The contractors were: -

MMP Construction (NE), Newton Aycliffe
Gus Robinson Developments Ltd., Hartlepool
Mowlem Construction Plc, Gateshead

The contractors were informed that the following scoring system would operate: -

Quality: Price ratio 60: 40

References, Presentations and Interviews would account for 60% of the total score

Price would account for 40% of the total score.

The contractors were required to confirm that the project could be built for the budget cost, and to submit their costs for Preliminaries, Overheads and Profit.

Mowlem Construction Plc sent their apologies for not being able to attend for interview this time.

Following presentations and interviews, the scoring matrix was completed and the results were as follows: -

Constructor	A	B
References	20.00	18.95
Presentation and Interview	40.00	39.83
Price	40.00	39.75
Total	100.00	98.53

Contract Procedure Rule 10(vii) states that the contractor with the highest Partnering Score will be accepted.

Constructor A, Gus Robinson Developments Ltd, will be appointed for this project.

3 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The overall budget for this project is £1,371,000.00. The Contractor has confirmed that the project can be built within the available budget and to the timescale required.

4 RECOMMENDATIONS

That the Panel receives this report for information.

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL

Report To Portfolio Holder

19 DECEMBER 2005



Report of: Acting Assistant Director (Community Services)

Subject: CENTRAL ATTRACTORS CAPITAL
IMPROVEMENT SCHEME

1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 This development relates to the major improvements planned at the Hartlepool Maritime Experience and Wingfield Castle which will assist the integration of the HMS Trincomalee into the single visitor attraction.

2. BACKGROUND

- 2.1 The improvement works are planned over three phases. The Culture, Housing and Transportation Portfolio meeting held on 9th November 2005 approved the appointment of two specialist contracts and a shortlist of exhibition designers to enable differing elements of the project to be advanced. I attach as **APPENDIX 1** the minute of the above meeting giving approval for the current course of action.
- 2.2 The appointment of Maritime Sector Specialists as managing engineers for the dry docking and refurbishment of the PSS Wingfield Castle has enabled the hull works and associated engineering works to be issued to tender. The tenders for this work are to be presented for opening within this meeting.
- 2.3 It is anticipated that appointment to contract can be undertaken quickly to enable the work to be completed within a tight schedule, dictated by the tides and ability to access and egress the dry dock within the Historic Quay.

3. RECOMMENDATION

- 3.1 That the report be noted for information.

APPENDIX 1*Extract From:*

**CULTURE, HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION PORTFOLIO –
DECISION RECORD –
9TH NOVEMBER 2005**

Present:

Councillor Robbie Payne (Culture, Housing and Transportation Portfolio Holder)

Officers: John Mennear, Acting Assistant Director (Cultural Services)
Mike Blair, Acting Transportation and Traffic Manager
David Cosgrove, Principal Democratic Services Officer
Jo Wilson, Democratic Services Officer

Also present Councillors Rob Cook and Steve Wallace

**57 Appointment of Specialist Contractors to the
Capital Programme at the Hartlepool Maritime
Experience – Para 8 (Acting Assistant Director (Community
Services))**

Type of decision

Non Key.

Purpose of report

To seek approval to appoint specialist contractors to undertake the upgrading of the 'Fighting Ships' sound sequence and the dry docking and hull repairs of PSS Wingfield Castle.

To seek approval of a shortlist of exhibition design companies to submit design proposals for new exhibition galleries within the attraction to a fixed budget.

Issue(s) for consideration by Portfolio Holder

Full details of the issue are set out in the exempt section of the minutes.

Decision

- i. That the budgetary elements be approved
- ii. That the proposed project procurement proposals through specialist providers be approved
- iii. That the selected tenderers list for the exhibition via a design submission to a fixed price be approved.

J A BROWN**CHIEF SOLICITOR****PUBLICATION DATE: 16th November 2005**