

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL AGENDA



Monday 5th November 2007

at 10.00 a.m.

**in the Red Room, Avondale Centre,
Dyke House, Hartlepool
(Raby Road entrance)**

MEMBERS: CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL:

Councillors Fleming, Flintoff, Simmons, Sutheran and Wistow

- 1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**
- 2. TO RECEIVE ANY DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST BY MEMBERS**
- 3. MINUTES**
 - 3.1 To confirm the minutes of the meeting held on 22nd October 2007 (*attached*)
- 4. ITEMS FOR INFORMATION**
 - 4.1 Tender Opening – Building Schools for the Future (BSF) ICT Educational and Technical Consultants (Ref 236) – *Director of Children's Services*
 - 4.2 Corporate Performance Management Solution – *Assistant Chief Executive*
- 5. ANY OTHER ITEMS WHICH THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS ARE URGENT**
- 6. LOCAL GOVERNMENT (ACCESS TO INFORMATION) ACT 1985**

EXEMPT ITEMS

Under Section 100(A)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following items of business on the grounds that it involves the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in the paragraph 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985

7. OPENING OF TENDERS

7.1 ICT Technical and Educational Advisors (Ref 236) – *Principal Project Officer (Strategy and Procurement)*

8. ANY OTHER CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS WHICH THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS ARE URGENT

ITEMS FOR INFORMATION

i) **Date of Next Meeting Monday 19th November 2007 commencing at 10.00am in the Yellow Room, Avondale Centre, Dyke House.**

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL

MINUTES AND DECISION RECORD

22nd October 2007

The meeting commenced at 10.00 a.m. in the Avondale Centre, Hartlepool

PRESENT: Bob Flintoff (In the Chair);
Councillors Timothy Fleming, Chris Simmons, Lilian Sutheran
and Gerald Wistow

OFFICERS: Terry Maley, ICS Project Co-ordinator
Israr Hussain, Economic Development Officer
Roger Kennedy, Quantity Surveying Team Leader
Rob Smith, Senior Regeneration Officer
Chris Walker, Senior Legal Assistant
Jo Wilson, Democratic Services Officer

56. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

None

57. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Councillor Gerald Wistow declared a personal and prejudicial interest in item no 59 and left the room during consideration of this item.

58. MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 8th OCTOBER 2007

Agreed

59. DEVELOPMENT OF AN INTEGRATED COMMISSIONING STRATEGY FOR THE CHILDREN AND YOUNG PEOPLE'S STRATEGIC PARTNERSHIP – *Director of Children's Services*

Members were advised that Integrated Commissioning was an important part of the Government's 'Every Child Matters: Change for Children' agenda. The Children's and young People's Strategic Partnership would develop a clear workable approach to joint planning and integrated commissioning. To take this work forward the Office for Public Management would lead a short project with Partnership members and senior managers to establish a model for integrated commissioning for children, young people and families in Hartlepool.

The cost of this project would be approximately £10,000. The Council's Contract Procedure Rules state that for contracts between £5,000 and

£20,000 three quotations should be obtained wherever possible. However these rules do not apply to contracts with professional persons or contractors for the execution of works in which the professional knowledge and skills of these contractors is of the primary importance. An exception to standard Contract Procedure rules was authorised by the Children's Services Portfolio Holder allowing the local authority to procure the expert services of the Office for Public Management.

Decision

- i. That the development of a joint planning and integrated commissioning strategy for the Children and Young Persons Strategic Partnership be noted
- ii. That the exception to the Council's Contract Procedure Rules granted by the Children's Services Portfolio Holder on 4th September 2007 be noted.

60. RESULTS OF TENDER FOR HARTLEPOOL SOUTHERN BUSINESS ZONE – FEASIBILITY STUDY– *Director of Regeneration and Planning Services*

On 13th September 2007 three tender submissions for the appointment of consultants to undertake the Hartlepool Southern Business Zone feasibility study were opened and recorded by the Contract Scrutiny Panel. A panel to score, interview and appoint the consultants was set up consisting of members from the strategic partnership set up to manage the project. The tender submissions were scored by members of this Panel and interviews with all three companies were held on 8th October 2007. The decision was based on a 70:30 quality:price ratio. Following this process it was agreed that Ecotec be awarded the contract as a result of the highest score achieved.

Decision

That the awarding of the Hartlepool Southern Business Zone feasibility study contract to Ecotec be noted

61. LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACCESS TO INFORMATION

Under Section 100(A)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the press and public were excluded from the meeting for the following item of business on the grounds that it involved the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in paragraph 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) Order 2006.

Minute 62 – Children's Centre at Kingsley Primary School (para 3 - information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (including the authority holding that information)).

Minute 63 – Central Area Investment Framework (para 3 - information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (including the authority holding that information)).

Minute 65 – *Central Area Investment Framework* (para 3 - information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (including the authority holding that information)).

62. CHILDREN'S CENTRE AT KINGSLEY PRIMARY SCHOOL – *Director of Adult and Community Services and Director of Neighbourhood Services*

Members were informed that tenders had been received in respect of the above project.

63. CENTRAL AREA INVESTMENT FRAMEWORK – *Senior Regeneration Officer*

Members were informed that tenders had been received in respect of the above project.

64. ANY OTHER CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS THE CHAIR CONSIDERS ARE URGENT

The Chair ruled that the following item should be considered by the Panel as a matter of urgency in accordance with the provisions of section 100(B)(4)(b) of the Local Government Act 1972.

65. CHILDREN'S CENTRE AT CLAVERING PRIMARY SCHOOL – *Senior Quantity Surveyor*

Members were informed that tenders had been received in respect of the above project.

R FLINTOFF

CHAIRMAN

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL
5th November 2007



Report of: Director of Children's Services

Subject: Tender Opening: Building Schools for the Future (BSF) ICT Educational and Technical Consultants (Ref: 236)

1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

To inform the panel of the requirement to tender for ICT Educational and Technical Consultancy Services for the Building School for the Future (BSF) Programme.

2. BACKGROUND

The Strategy for Change (SfC) documentation must include detailed information relating to the ICT strategic vision for Hartlepool developed through working in partnership with secondary school colleagues. ICT Educational and Technical consultants are required to facilitate this work with schools and support the completion of the ICT output specifications for the Outline Business Case (OBC). In addition, ICT Educational consultants are required to support schools in completing the visioning process for individual School Strategy for Change submissions.

Invitations to tender have been issued to the 11 companies listed on the Partnerships for Schools/Becta ICT Consultancy Services Framework. Becta has already conducted the EU tender process, therefore Hartlepool has to run a mini competition between the suppliers on the framework. Tenders are to be returned for opening at Scrutiny Panel on 5th November 2007.

Budget estimates for these services are estimated to be in the region of £130,000 for consultancy services up to OBC.

3. PROPOSALS

Given the likely value of these services being in excess of the £45,000 limit associated with quotations, the process of tendering has been undertaken to procure ICT Educational and Technical consultancy services.

4. RECOMMENDATIONS

That all tenders received by the deadline date of 26th October 2007 are opened at the subsequent meeting.

5. REASONS FOR RECOMMENDATIONS

All tendering companies have been vetted and approved by Partnerships for Schools and Becta.

6. CONTACT OFFICER

Rachel Smith
Principal Project Officer (Strategy and Procurement)
Children's Services
01429 523761
rachel.smith@hartlepool.gov.uk

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL

5 November 2007



Report of: Assistant Chief Executive

Subject: Corporate Performance Management Solution

1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 To update the panel on the decision to select a new Corporate Performance Management Solution to monitor and report on future Performance Management issues.

2. BACKGROUND

- 2.1 The Contract Scrutiny Panel was advised on 23 April of the intention to advertise in the local press and a professional journal for organisations to express an interest in providing a Corporate Performance Management System. The Council received 12 expressions of interest and, following an evaluation, 9 organisations were formally invited to tender.
- 2.2 A total of 7 tender submissions were received by the deadline of 12noon on 29 June 2007 and were opened and recorded by the Panel at its meeting on 3 July (Minute No. 13).

3. PROPOSALS

- 3.1 After analysis of the full tender submissions three organisations were short listed for the final stage of the assessment process. As agreed by the Performance Management Portfolio Holder at the meeting on 23 April the assessment was scored using a Price:Performance Ratio of 50:50.
- 3.2 The performance aspect of the assessment was split into 3 parts, whereby written references were obtained from existing clients, a site visit was undertaken to view each of the potential systems in operation and each organisation was invited to provide a demonstration to a panel of Council Employees. The panel consisted of 11 Council officers who marked the demonstrations based on how the system met the requirements as detailed in the Tender Specification.

- 3.3 The scores from each stage of the assessment were entered into a scoring matrix, along with a score based on the price quoted by each of the organisations. The highest score was obtained by Consilium Technologies Limited and it was agreed by all officers that they presented the best overall package, and they were invited to enter into a contract with the Council on 5 October 2007. The score matrix is attached for information as **Appendix A**.

4. RECOMMENDATION

- 4.1 That members of the panel note the decision to select Consilium Technologies Limited to deliver a new Corporate Performance Management Solution.

5. CONTACT OFFICER

David Hunt
Strategy and Performance Officer
Corporate Strategy Division
Hartlepool Borough Council
01429 284073
david.hunt@hartlepool.gov.uk

4.2 APPENDIX A

Final Scoring Matrix

The potential systems were evaluated using 4 different assessments. Each of these 4 assessments, and their total weightings are shown in the table below: -

Organisation	Price (50% - 200pts)	References (5% - 20 pts)			Site Visits (25% - 100 pts)			Presentation (20% - 80 pts)			Total
		Score	Weight	Adj Score	Score	Weight	Adj Score	Score	Weight	Adj Score	
Triangle Computer Services Ltd	140	259	0.071	18	513	0.1282	65.5	78.0	0.727	56.5	280.0
Consilium Technologies Ltd	140	254.5	0.071	18	654	0.1282	83.5	83.1	0.727	60.0	301.5
Aspiren Ltd.	160	250	0.071	17.5	342	0.1282	43.8	75.5	0.727	54.5	275.8

The above is calculated using the criteria shown below.

Price – Total points available 200.

References – Total points available from references 282. Total adjusted score available 20pts.

Site Visits – Total points available from Site Visits 780. Total adjusted score available 100.

Presentation – Total points available from Presentation 110. Total adjusted score available 80.

(Note: For each stage scores will be rounded down to nearest 0.5point)