

# CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL AGENDA



**Monday 19<sup>th</sup> November 2007**

**at 10.00 a.m.**

**in the Yellow Room, Avondale Centre,  
Dyke House, Hartlepool  
(Raby Road entrance)**

**MEMBERS: CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL:**

Councillors Flintoff, Gibbon, Simmons, Sutheran and Wistow

- 1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**
- 2. TO RECEIVE ANY DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST BY MEMBERS**
- 3. MINUTES**
  - 3.1 To confirm the minutes of the meeting held on 5<sup>th</sup> November 2007 (*attached*)
- 4. ITEMS FOR INFORMATION**
  - 4.1 Appointment of Contractor for the Provision of the Kerbside Recycling Collection Service – *Director of Neighbourhood Services*
- 5. ANY OTHER ITEMS WHICH THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS ARE URGENT**
- 6. LOCAL GOVERNMENT (ACCESS TO INFORMATION) ACT 1985**

## **EXEMPT ITEMS**

Under Section 100(A)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following items of business on the grounds that it involves the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in the paragraph 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985

**7. OPENING OF TENDERS**

- 7.1 Transport Interchange – Subway Infill Works (228) – *Senior Project Engineer*
- 7.2 Tall Ships Design Brief (237) – *Tourism Officer*

**8. ANY OTHER CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS WHICH THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS ARE URGENT**

**ITEMS FOR INFORMATION**

- i) **Date of Next Meeting Monday 3<sup>rd</sup> December 2007 commencing at 10.00am in the Red Room, Avondale Centre, Dyke House.**

## **CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL**

### **MINUTES AND DECISION RECORD**

5<sup>th</sup> November 2007

The meeting commenced at 10.00 a.m. in the Avondale Centre, Hartlepool

**PRESENT:** Councillor Bob Flintoff (In the Chair);  
Councillor Chris Simmons

Also Present in accordance with Council Procedure rule 4.2 Councillor Mary Fleet attended as substitute for Councillor Lilian Sutheran.

**OFFICERS:** Rachel Smith, Principal Project Officer (Strategy and Procurement)  
David Hunt, Strategy and Performance Officer  
Chris Walker, Senior Legal Assistant  
Jo Wilson, Democratic Services Officer

#### **65. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies were received from Councillor Timothy Fleming and Lilian Sutheran.

#### **66. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

None

#### **67. MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 22<sup>nd</sup> OCTOBER 2007**

Agreed

#### **68. TENDER OPENING – BUILDING SCHOOLS FOR THE FUTURE (BSF) ICT EDUCATIONAL AND TECHNICAL CONSULTANTS (REF 236) – *Director of Children's Services***

The Strategy for Change documentation must include detailed information relating to the ICT strategic vision for Hartlepool developed through working in partnership with secondary school colleagues. ICT Educational and Technical consultants are required to facilitate this work with schools and support the completion of the ICT output specifications for the Outline Business Case. In addition, ICT Educational consultants are required to support schools in completing the visioning process for individual School Strategy for Change submissions.

Invitations to tender were issued to 11 companies listed on the Partnerships for Schools/Becta ICT Consultancy Services Framework with the intent of these being opened at this meeting of Contract Scrutiny Panel.

### **Decision**

That all tenders received by the deadline date of 26<sup>th</sup> October 2007 be opened at this meeting of Contract Scrutiny Panel.

## **69. CORPORATE PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT SOLUTION – Assistant Chief Executive**

At their meeting on 23<sup>rd</sup> April 2007 Contract Scrutiny Panel were advised of the intention to advertise for organisations to express an interest in providing a Corporate Performance Management System. Twelve expressions of interest were received and following evaluation nine organisations were invited to tender.

A total of seven tender submissions were received by the deadline on 29<sup>th</sup> June 2007 and opened by the Panel at their meeting on 3<sup>rd</sup> July 2007.

After analysis three organisations were shortlisted for the final stage of the assessment process. The assessment was scored using a price:performance ratio of 50:50 as agreed by the Performance Management Portfolio Holder. Written references were obtained, a site visit was undertaken and each organisation was invited to provide a demonstration to a panel of Council employees. The scores from each stage were entered into a scoring matrix, along with a score based on the price quoted. The highest score was obtained by Consilium Technologies Ltd and it was agreed by all officers that they presented the best overall package. They were invited to enter into a contract with the Council on 5<sup>th</sup> October 2007.

Following queries from members the Strategy and Performance Officer gave detailed information regarding the evaluation of the performance aspect of the procedure, particularly in respect of the objectivity of the Council officers evaluating the tender submissions..

### **Decision**

That the decision to select Consilium Technologies Ltd to deliver a new Corporate Performance Management solution be noted.

## **70. LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACCESS TO INFORMATION**

Under Section 100(A)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the press and public were excluded from the meeting for the following item of business on the grounds that it involved the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in paragraph 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the

Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) Order 2006.

Minute 71 – ICT Technical and Educational Advisors (Ref 236) (para 3 - information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (including the authority holding that information)).

**71. ICT TECHNICAL AND EDUCATIONAL ADVISORS (REF 236) –**  
*Principal Project Officer (Strategy and Procurement)*

Members were informed that tenders had been received in respect of the above project.

R FLINTOFF

CHAIRMAN

# CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL

19 November 2007



**Report of:** Director of Neighbourhood Services

**Subject:** APPOINTMENT OF CONTRACTOR FOR THE  
PROVISION OF THE KERBSIDE RECYCLING  
COLLECTION SERVICE

---

## 1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 To advise members of the panel of the outcome of the evaluation process to select a contractor for the Kerbside Recycling Collection Service.

## 2. BACKGROUND

- 2.1 Members may recall from the Contract Scrutiny Panel that appropriate contractors were being sought for the provision of the Kerbside Recycling Collection Service.
- 2.2 Eight companies expressed an interest, five of which were short listed following the pre-qualification questionnaire evaluation.
- 2.3 Members may also recall this was a joint procurement exercise for Hartlepool, Redcar and Cleveland and Middlesbrough Borough Council, with ourselves taking the lead role regarding procurement.

## 3. TENDERER EVALUATION

- 3.1 Two tenders were received by the Contract Scrutiny panel on 8 May 2007. In view of the joint procurement exercise tenders were recorded and each authority tasked with carrying out their own evaluation of each tender.
- 3.2 Redcar & Cleveland Borough Council and ourselves undertook a joint desk top exercise and carried out interviews to clarify any issues identified in the tender submission and to receive a presentation as to the method of operation. Middlesbrough Borough Council received the tenders as part of a market testing exercise and extended their existing contract to terminate at the same time as our own.

- 3.3 The Council's in-house service provider provided costs to be evaluated at the same time as the tender evaluation following the Council's procurement guidelines. Unfortunately, even though the Neighbourhood Services Scrutiny Committee had expressed a view the service be provided by the in-house teams, the set up and ongoing revenue costs did not make this a viable option at this stage. This will, however, be something the Tees Valley authorities will explore over the length of this contract.
- 3.4 The tender submissions were evaluated in line with the evaluation specification and best and final offers were analysed following the interviews covered in 3.2.
- 3.5 Abitibi Recycling have been awarded a 28 month contract commencing 15 October 2007, for Hartlepool Borough Council.

#### **4. RECOMMENDATIONS**

- 4.1 Members are asked to note the report.