

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL AGENDA



Monday, 14 January 2008

at 10.00 a.m.

**in the Blue Room, Avondale Centre,
Dyke House, Hartlepool
(Raby Road entrance)**

MEMBERS: CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL:

Councillors Akers-Belcher, Flintoff, Kaiser, Simmons, Sutheran,

1. **APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**
2. **TO RECEIVE ANY DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST BY MEMBERS**
3. **MINUTES**
 - 3.1 To confirm the minutes of the meeting held on 17th December 2007 (*attached*)
4. **ITEMS FOR INFORMATION**
 - 4.1 Verbal Feedback on Overruns and Overspends – *Chief Solicitor*
 - 4.2 Results of tender for Tall Ships Races 2010 Hartlepool – Design Brief – *Tourism Officer*
5. **ANY OTHER ITEMS WHICH THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS ARE URGENT**
6. **LOCAL GOVERNMENT (ACCESS TO INFORMATION) ACT 1985**

EXEMPT ITEMS

Under Section 100(A)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following items of business on the grounds that it involves the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in the paragraph 3 of

Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985

7. OPENING OF TENDERS

- 7.1 Tender Opening: Building Schools for the Future (BSF) Educational Consultants (Ref: 242) – *Principal Project Officer (Strategy and Procurement) Children’s Services*
- 7.2 Tender Opening: Longhill and Sandgate CCTV Scheme - *Electrical Engineering Team Leader*

8. ANY OTHER CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS WHICH THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS ARE URGENT

ITEMS FOR INFORMATION

- i) **Date of Next Meeting Monday 28th January 2008 commencing at 10.00am – in the Blue Room, Avondale Centre, Raby Road (Dyke House Entrance)**

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL

MINUTES AND DECISION RECORD

17 December 2007

The meeting commenced at 10.00 a.m. in the Red Room, Avondale Centre,
Dyke House, Hartlepool

PRESENT: Councillor Simmons (In the Chair);
Councillors Gibbon and Sutheran

OFFICERS: Tony Brown, Chief Solicitor
Chris Walker, Senior Legal Assistant
Rachel Smith, Principal Project Officer (Strategy & Procurement)
Dave Thompson, Principal Engineer (Environmental Issues)
Andy Golightly, Senior Regeneration Officer
Jo Wilson, Democratic Services Officer
Sarah Bird, Democratic Services Officer

85. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Councillors Flintoff and Worthy

86. APPOINTMENT OF CHAIR

In the absence of the usual Chair, it was agreed that Councillor Simmons would act as Chair of the meeting.

87. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

None.

88. MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 3 DECEMBER 2007

Confirmed.

89. RESULTS OF TENDER FOR BUILDING SCHOOLS FOR THE FUTURE (BSF) ICT EDUCATIONAL AND TECHNICAL CONSULTANTS – *Principal Project Officer (Strategy and Procurement)*

Purpose of Report

To inform members of the panel of the decision made regarding the appointment of ICT Educational and Technical Consultancy Services for the Building Schools for the Future (BSF) Programme.

Issues for Panel's Consideration

Five tender submissions had been received on 26 October 2007 and were opened and recorded by the Contract Scrutiny Panel at its meeting on 5 November 2007. Two companies Tribal and Faber Maunsell were shortlisted on the basis of quality and cost. Interviews had been held on 23 November 2007 following which the decision was made to award the contract to Tribal. The overall scoring was based on the written submission (60%) and the presentation/interview process (40%).

Decision

The Panel noted the decision to select Tribal as ICT Educational and Technical Consultants until the completion of the Outline Business Case for the BSF programme.

90. REPORT ON REMIT OF PANEL – *Chief Solicitor*

The Chief Solicitor gave a verbal report on the remit of the panel. He stated that he had spoken with the Head of Procurement and Property Services to achieve the suggestions put forward by the Panel previously.

- That a pre-addressed label for submission of tenders be included in the tender packages in order that the tender is received by the correct department. This should be ongoing within approximately one week.
- That a summary page be included in the tender submissions in order to ensure ease of access to the price when the tender is opened at the Contract Scrutiny Panel. This will require an amount of work because some tenders have a more complex submission than others but should be available in about a month.
- Post room and reception staff will be able to stamp the tender with the time and date received in order to highlight any late submissions. This could be incorporated onto the address label with an 'official use only' section. Training would be required for staff. A receipt sheet could be handed to anyone delivering by hand.
- More work would be done to standardise the interview panels as there was no central department to provide a common thread but a detailed guidance document would be made available to ensure consistency. This could take three to four months to complete.
- As the Panel had requested feedback on levels of overspend or failure to perform in the required time by contractors, the Head of Procurement and Property Services had agreed to provide feedback on statistical and practical items for the Chief Solicitor to give an overview to the panel at its meeting on 14 January 2008. This information was already regularly given to

the Portfolio holder.

91. RESULTS OF TENDER FOR HARTLEPOOL CENTRAL AREA INVESTMENT FRAMEWORK – Senior Regeneration Officer

Purpose of Report

To inform members of the panel of the decision made regarding appointing consultants for undertaking the Hartlepool Central Area Investment Framework.

Issues for the Panel's Consideration

The Central Area Hartlepool Investment Framework commission went through an open tender process after being advertised. A brief had been prepared and was sent out to thirty five consultancies, eight of whom submitted tenders which had been opened at the meeting of the Contract Scrutiny Panel on 22 October 2007. A panel to score, interview and appoint the consultants had been set up which consisted of Hartlepool Borough Council and One North East representatives. The submissions were scored against a number of criteria such as value for money and an appreciation of the issues, challenges and opportunities afforded by the brief. Four consultancies were selected for interview and an evaluation scoring matrix was completed based on quality (70%) and price (30%). The successful applicant was Genecon.

Decision

The members of the panel noted the award of the Central Area Investment Framework contract to Genecon.

92. LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACCESS TO INFORMATION

Under Section 100(A)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the press and public were excluded from the meeting for the following item of business on the grounds that it involved the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in paragraph 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) Order 2006.

Minute 93 Hartlepool Transport Interchange Subway Infill Works (228) (para 3 - information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (including the authority holding that information)).

Minute 94 Demolition of Eldon Grove Community Sports Centre (54) (para 3 - information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (including the authority holding that information)).

93. HARTLEPOOL TRANSPORT INTERCHANGE SUBWAY INFILL WORKS (228) – Principal Engineer (Environmental Issues)

Members were informed that tenders had been received in respect of the above project.

94. DEMOLITION OF ELDON GROVE COMMUNITY SPORTS CENTRE (54) - Principal Engineer (Environmental Issues)

Members were informed that tenders had been received in respect of the above project.

C SIMMONS

CHAIRMAN

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL

14 January 2008



Report of: Assistant Director (Planning & Economic Development)

Subject: Results of tender for Tall Ships' Races 2010 Hartlepool - Design Brief (Contract Reference 237)

1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 To inform members of the panel of the decision made regarding appointing a design agency to work with Hartlepool Borough Council and its partners to deliver the Hartlepool Tall Ships' Races marketing activity.

2. BACKGROUND

- 2.1 The Council had received approval through the Regeneration and Liveability Portfolio (19 October 2007) to appoint a design agency to work with Hartlepool Borough Council and its partners in setting up marketing materials / templates required to promote The Tall Ships' Races event in Hartlepool in 2010.
- 2.2 Appointing an agency up to and including the event will provide continuity in delivery, consistency for all officers and external partners involved in delivery and best value in terms of resources. The agency is to be appointed for a one year contract, with the option to extend the contract for a further two 12 month periods, subject to mutual agreement by both parties.
- 2.3 The tender was advertised in the Northern Echo on Thursday 25 October 2007 and on www.supply2.gov.uk and Hartlepool's Borough Council's website. 131 requests were received expressing an interest in receiving a copy of the design brief.

- 2.4 All received tenders were opened at the meeting of Contract Scrutiny Panel on Monday 19 November 2007. A total of 46 tenders were received with 4 dismissed at the meeting for lateness.

3. PROPOSALS

- 3.1 A Panel to score, interview and appoint the design agency was set up which consisted of Hartlepool Borough Council officers and key partners (PD Ports, Middleton Grange Shopping Centre, visitTeesvalley) who are members of the Tall Ships Visitor Information, Marketing, Promotion, Education & Accommodation Workstream.
- 3.2 The tender submissions were scored on Wednesday 21 November 2007 by members of the panel. 6 companies who achieved the highest scores (over 50%) were then invited to interviews held on Wednesday 12 December 2007.
- 3.3 A decision was made on the bases of quality (70% visual & brief, 70% interview) and price (30%) of the submissions received and as can be seen from the scoring matrix, the highest score was RDW.
- 3.4 The Panel therefore has awarded the contract to RDW as a result of the highest score achieved.

4. RECOMMENDATION

- 4.1 That members of the panel note the award of the Tall Ships Design Brief for Hartlepool contract to RDW.

5. CONTACT OFFICER

Jo Cole
Tourism Officer
Regeneration & Planning Services
(01429) 523508
Jo.cole@hartlepool.gov.uk