

CONTRACT SCRUTINY COMMITTEE AGENDA



Monday, 23 November 2009

at 10.00 am

in Committee Room C, Civic Centre, Hartlepool

MEMBERS: CONTRACT SCRUTINY COMMITTEE:

Councillors Atkinson, Fleet, Flintoff, Griffin, Morris, Plant, Richardson, Simmons and Young.

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

2. TO RECEIVE ANY DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST BY MEMBERS

3. MINUTES

3.1 To confirm the minutes of the meeting held on 9 November 2009

4. ITEMS FOR INFORMATION

4.1 Printing Framework - Assistant Director (*Procurement and Asset Management*)

5. ANY OTHER ITEMS WHICH THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS ARE URGENT

6. LOCAL GOVERNMENT (ACCESS TO INFORMATION) (VARIATION) ORDER 2006

EXEMPT ITEMS

Under Section 100(A)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following items of business on the grounds that it involves the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in the paragraphs referred to below of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) Order 2006

7. TENDERS TO BE OPENED

- 7.1 Café Extension at Surestart Building, Hindpool Close (CRN 423) - *Quantity Surveying Team Leader* (Para 3)
- 7.2 Printing & Mailing Service For Local Taxation Demands And Benefit Notifications (CRN 432) – *Revenues Manager* (Para 3)

8. ANY OTHER CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS WHICH THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS ARE URGENT

CONTRACT SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

MINUTES AND DECISION RECORD

9 November 2009

The meeting commenced at 10.00 a.m. in the Civic Centre, Hartlepool

PRESENT: Councillor Atkinson (In the Chair);
Councillors Fleet, Flintoff, Griffin, Dr Morris, Richardson, Young

In Accordance with council Procedure Rule 4.2, Councillor C Akers Belcher was in attendance as substitute for Councillor Simmons

OFFICERS: Karen Oliver, Neighbourhood Manager
Ian Merritt, Head of Commissioning and Children's Trust
Anne Smith, Head of Information Planning and Support Services
Richard Starrs, Neighbourhood Renewal and Strategy Officer
Jo Cole, Principal Economic Development Officer (Tourism)
David Hart, Strategic Procurement Manager
David Dockree, Estates Manager
Lesley Strickland, Tall Ships Project Officer
Chris Walker, Senior Legal Assistant
Sarah Bird, Democratic Services Officer
Jess Coulson, Democratic Services Modern Apprentice

77. Apologies for Absence

Councillors Plant and Simmons

78. Declarations of Interest

None

79. Minutes of the meeting held on 26 October 2009

These were confirmed as an accurate account

80. Re-advertisement of Tender – *Head of Commissioning and Children's Trust*

The report was presented in order to inform the Committee of the re-advertisement of a tender pertaining to the provision of services for the Team Around the Primary School (Formerly Children's Fund). The previous advertisement only produced one submission and therefore a decision had been taken to re-advertise this project. Three Pre-Qualification Questionnaires (PQQ) had been received and assessed

and the agencies had been invited to submit tenders.

Decision

The Committee noted the re-advertisement of this project and revised timelines.

81. Invitation to Participate in Dialogue (IPD) Stage 2 Opening of Submissions: Building Schools for the Future (BSF) Information and Communication Technology (ICT) Managed Service (reference 20)
– Head of Information Planning and Support Services

The report was given in order to inform the Committee of the requirement to tender for the ICT Managed Service Contract for the BSF programme.

The initial six companies who had completed a PQQ in relation to this project had been evaluated through various stages resulting in two successful bidders being identified. Since that time there had been extensive dialogue between the local authority and the two bidders and an Invitation to Submit Final Bids had been issued to the two bidders on 2 November with a closing date of 6 November 2009.

Decision

The Committee noted the contents of the report and that there were two tenders to be opened later in the meeting.

82. Training and Employment Tender for Dyke House/Stranton/Grange, West View, King Oswy, Central Estate and Headland Neighbourhood Action Plan Areas – *Neighbourhood Renewal and Strategy Officer*

The report was presented in response to the deferring of the opening of tenders at the last meeting of the Committee and outlined the background to the decision by the Neighbourhood Action Plan (NAP) Forums to pool their resources in order to initiate a project to tackle unemployment in their areas. Members had expressed concern at the last meeting that this project would duplicate the work of the Future Jobs Fund (FJF). However the Committee was reminded that the eligibility of the FJF was fairly narrow and this project would encompass a wider client base. The Economic Development Manager had advised that the proposed NAP programme would not impact on proposed FJF activities in North Hartlepool and would actively work with the successful tender to ensure a complementary fit to the activities to be delivered both through the FJF and the NAP tender.

A Member referred to NAP forums funding family case workers which had since been withdrawn and would be delivered by Job Centre Plus. The Member also expressed concern that the Economic Development Department had said that they would actively work with the successful tenderer to ensure a complementary fit to the activities being delivered through the FJF and NAP tender, but that department was to be submitting a tender for the NAP project. The Neighbourhood Manager clarified that the family case workers project had been evaluated. She reaffirmed that the decision for the project had come from the NAP Forums and had been the subject of a lot of discussion by them and this was what the Forums wished to spend their money on. Chairs of the forums would be involved in appointing the agencies who were to provide the work. The Member asked whether the Economic Development Department had the capacity to take on the extra work if their bid was successful and was informed that the capacity was there. The Member also asked a number of questions which the Neighbourhood Manager was unable to answer as they were in relation to the Economic Development Department. She did however, agree to ensure that part of the interview process would be to ask what their involvement with the FJF was.

Another Member asked that legal advice be sought about the possibility of conflict of interest between the Economic Development Department's interests in the FJF and the training and employment tender.

Decision

The Committee noted the report.

83. Results of the Evaluation of Pre Qualification Questionnaire Responses for a Printing and Mailing Service for Local Taxation Demands and Benefit Notifications – Revenues Manager

The report was presented in order to inform Members of the outcome of the evaluation of those responses received from potential service providers for the provision of a printing and mailing service for council tax/business rates demands and council tax/housing benefit notifications.

Since February 2006 the Council had printed and mailed its annual council tax/business rates bills and benefit notifications off site and more recently in partnership with Darlington Borough Council. The Finance and Performance Portfolio Holder had recently approved the joint procurement of a print and mail service for local taxation demands and benefit notifications with Darlington Borough Council via an OJEC tender exercise. The report set out the timescale of the tender exercise and it was expected that the tenders would be opened by the Committee at their meeting on 23 November 2009.

A Member asked whether there had been cashable and/or non cashable savings and was informed that because in house printers were not now necessary, savings of around £5,000 would be made. This system also provided an improved standard of service to the customer as well. The Member also asked whether this would impact on the Authority's strategic partnership with Northgate and was informed that it would, and therefore further savings would be made via this.

Decision

The Committee noted the conclusion of the process of evaluation of the PQQs.

84. Local Government - Access to Information

Under Section 100 (A)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the press and public were excluded from the meeting for the following items of business on the grounds that it convolved the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in paragraph 3 of Part 1 of the Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information)(Variation) order 2006

Minute 85 – Opening of Catering Concession Tenders – para 3 information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (Including the Authority holding that information)

Minute 86 – Building Schools for the Future (BSF) ICT Managed Service - para 3 information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (Including the Authority holding that information)

Minute 87 – Ratings List Review 2010 - para 3 information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (Including the Authority holding that information)

Minute 88 – Training and Employment Tender for Dyke House/Stranton/Grange, West View/King Oswy, Central Estate and Headland Neighbourhood Action Plan Areas - para 3 information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (Including the Authority holding that information)

Minute 89 – Tall Ships Merchandising - para 3 information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (Including the Authority holding that information)

85. Opening of Catering Concession Tenders – Tall Ships Project Officer

41 tenders had been received although one of these was late and was

therefore not opened at the meeting.

Decision

The Committee noted the opening of the tenders in relation to this contract.

86. Building Schools for the Future (BSF) ICT Managed Service - *Head of Information Planning and Support Services*

Two tenders had been received in respect of this contract and were opened in the presence of the Committee

Decision

The Committee noted the opening of these two tenders.

87. Ratings List Review 2010 – *Strategic Procurement Manager*

The Strategic Procurement Manager informed the meeting that due to problems with the process and advice from the Chief Solicitor, the procurement of this list should be started again.

Decision

The Committee noted that the process for tendering for the ratings list review 2010 would begin again.

88. Training and Employment Tender for Dyke House/Stranton/Grange, West View, King Oswy, Central Estate and Headland Neighbourhood Action Plan Areas – *Neighbourhood Renewal and Strategy Officer*

Four tenders had been received in respect of this project and these were opened in the presence of the Committee.

Decision

The Committee noted the opening of these tenders.

89. Tall Ships Merchandising - Principal Economic Development Officer (Tourism)

Two tenders had been received in respect of this contract and were opened in the presence of the Committee.

Decision

The Committee noted the opening of the tenders.

The meeting concluded at 12.05 pm.

CHAIRMAN

CONTRACT SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

23rd November 2009



Report of: Assistant Director (Procurement and Asset Management)

Subject: PRINTING FRAMEWORK

1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 To advise Members of the outcome of the selection of suppliers for this Contract.

2 BACKGROUND

- 2.1 Adverts were published in the Hartlepool Mail on the 14th August 2009 inviting companies to submit tenders. Local, small and medium (SMEs) were encouraged to bid for the contract by direct contract. One particular benefit of utilising local companies is that printing jobs can be collected or delivered quickly meaning that there should be no additional time taken to produce jobs and existing timeframes for completion of printing will continue to be offered. The potential value of the contract is £40K although there is no guarantee that this amount will be spent with any or all tenderers. The amount of work that will be sent out will be dependant upon the Print Unit's daily capacity, potential peaks in service demand and the complexity of work that is required. The general aim of the project is to obtain the best possible prices and delivery timescale for external printing work.
- 2.2 The Contract will be used by the Print Unit on a call off basis with 5 companies awarded the opportunity to win business on each of the 3 lots (Lot 1 – Corporate Printing Stationery, Lot 2 – General Printing Stationery, Lot 3 – Corporate Documents).
- 2.3 At a meeting of the Contract Scrutiny Committee on 28th September 2009, 13 tenders were considered, 2 of which had been received after the deadline date and were discounted. Tenders were received from the following companies:-

Tenderer No. 1	-	Star Print, Lancashire
Tenderer No. 2	-	Communis, Newcastle
Tenderer No. 3	-	Ords Limited, Hartlepool
Tenderer No. 4	-	Dscimm, Jarrow
Tenderer No. 5	-	Atkinsons, Hartlepool
Tenderer No. 6	-	Aztec, Washington
Tenderer No. 7	-	Vendridbge, Beverley
Tenderer No. 8	-	More, Glasgow
Tenderer No. 9	-	The Print Factory, Hartlepool
Tenderer No. 10	-	Public ID, Willerby
Tenderer No. 11	-	Tolputt Keeton, Tamworth

- 2.4 A panel consisting of the Central Services Manager, Strategic Procurement Manager and representatives from Procurement and Printing met to undertake the evaluation. The price/quality ratio was 40/60 and was weighted in favour of quality to take account of a number of non-price related criteria, particular emphasis being paid to delivery timeframes.
- 2.5 In terms of quality, companies were scored on their proposed methodology, such as account management, their responsiveness, any added value or innovation they can add to the contract, sustainability considerations and business continuity issues.

3. PROPOSALS

- 3.1 That the Council award the business to the following companies:-

Lot 1 – Corporate Printed Stationery	Lot 2 – General Printed Stationery	Lot 3 – Corporate Documents
Communis, Newcastle	Communis, Newcastle	Communis, Newcastle
Atkinsons, Hartlepool	Atkinsons, Hartlepool	Atkinsons, Hartlepool
Vendridge, Newcastle	Vendridge, Newcastle	Vendridge, Newcastle
The Print Factory, Hartlepool	The Print Factory, Hartlepool	The Print Factory, Hartlepool
Ords Limited, Hartlepool	Ords Limited, Hartlepool	Public ID, Telford

- 3.2 We have suggested the inclusion of 5 suppliers for each lot. This will provide a flexible arrangement and will ensure that where printing is not carried out in-house the framework will be able to meet our requirement thereby avoiding off-contract spend.

- 3.3 Three of the 5 suppliers for lots 1 and 2 are Hartlepool based as are 2 of the 5 suppliers identified for lot 3. This is positive outcome which supports the Council's commitment to the 'Buy Local'

4. RECOMMENDATIONS

- 4.1 That the Panel receives the report for information.