

# **HEALTH SCRUTINY FORUM AGENDA**



**Thursday, 2 September 2010**

**at 9.00 am**

**in Council Chamber  
Civic Centre, Hartlepool**

**MEMBERS: HEALTH SCRUTINY FORUM:**

Councillors S Akers-Belcher, Barker, Cook, Fleet, Griffin, A Lilley, G Lilley, McKenna and Simmons

**Resident Representatives:**

Liz Carroll, Mary Green and Linda Shields

- 1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**
- 2. TO RECEIVE ANY DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST BY MEMBERS**
- 3. MINUTES**
  - 3.1 To confirm the minutes of the meeting held on 3 August 2010 *(to follow)*
- 4. RESPONSES FROM LOCAL NHS BODIES, THE COUNCIL, EXECUTIVE OR COMMITTEES OF THE COUNCIL TO FINAL REPORTS OF THIS FORUM**

No Items

**5. CONSIDERATION OF REQUEST FOR SCRUTINY REVIEWS REFERRED VIA SCRUTINY CO-ORDINATING COMMITTEE**

No Items

**6. CONSIDERATION OF PROGRESS REPORTS / BUDGET AND POLICY FRAMEWORK DOCUMENTS**

No Items

**7. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION**

- 7.1 The Provision of Accident and Emergency (A & E)/ Minor Injuries Services in Hartlepool:-
- (a) Covering Report (Scrutiny Manager); and
  - (b) Joint Presentation by Representatives from both the North Tees & Hartlepool NHS Foundation Trust and Hartlepool Primary Care Trust.

**8. ISSUES IDENTIFIED FROM FORWARD PLAN**

**9. FEEDBACK FROM RECENT MEETING OF TEES VALLEY HEALTH SCRUTINY JOINT COMMITTEE**

No Items

**10. REGIONAL HEALTH SCRUTINY UPDATE**

No Items

**11. ANY OTHER ITEMS WHICH THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS ARE URGENT**

**ITEMS FOR INFORMATION**

**Date of Next Meeting:- Tuesday, 14 September 2010 at 3.00 pm in Committee Room B, Civic Centre, Hartlepool**

# HEALTH SCRUTINY FORUM

## MINUTES

3 August 2010

The meeting commenced at 3.00 p.m. in the Civic Centre, Hartlepool

**Present:**

Councillor Stephen Akers-Belcher (In the Chair);

Councillors: Rob Cook, Mary Fleet, Sheila Griffin, Alison Lilley and Geoff Lilley.

In accordance with Council Procedure Rule 4.2 (ii) Councillor Carl Richardson attended as a substitute for Councillor Chris Simmons

Resident Representatives: Mary Green and Linda Shields.

**Also Present:**

Iain Wright MP  
Councillor Jonathan Brash  
Stephen Thomas, LINK Development Officer, Hartlepool LINK  
Christopher Akers-Belcher LINK Co-ordinator, Hartlepool LINK,  
Zoe Sherry, Hartlepool LINK  
Alex Zielinski, Associate Director of Strategic Planning, North Tees and Hartlepool NHS Foundation Trust  
Nick McDonough, Assistant Director of Community Services, North Tees and Hartlepool NHS Foundation Trust  
Val Hall, Manager for Community Respiratory, North Tees and Hartlepool NHS Foundation Trust  
Lesley Cross, Contract Manager, NHS Tees  
Derek Samuel, Contracts Manager, York Road Dental Practice  
Alan Foster, Chief Executive, North Tees and Hartlepool NHS Foundation Trust  
Jill Carton, North Tees and Hartlepool NHS Foundation Trust  
Carl Parker, PEC Chair, NHS Hartlepool  
David Emerton, Medical Director, North Tees and Hartlepool NHS Foundation Trust  
Rabina Tindale, North Tees and Hartlepool NHS Foundation Trust

**Officers:**

James Walsh, Scrutiny Support Officer  
Elaine Hind, Scrutiny Support Officer  
David Cosgrove, Democratic Services Team

## 16. Apologies for Absence

Councillors Barker, McKenna and Simmons

**17. Declarations of Interest by Members**

None.

**18. Minutes of the meeting held on 22 June 2010**

Confirmed.

**19. Responses from the Council, the Executive or Committees of the Council to Final Reports of this Forum**

No items.

**20. Consideration of request for scrutiny reviews referred via Scrutiny Co-ordinating Committee**

No items.

**21. Consideration of progress reports/budget and policy framework documents**

No items.

**22. Any Other Business - Accident and Emergency Services in Hartlepool** (*Scrutiny Support Officer*)

The Chief Executive, North Tees and Hartlepool NHS Foundation Trust, was present at the meeting and thanked the Chair for the opportunity to discuss with the Forum the issues that had been reported in the press in relation to the Accident and Emergency (A&E) Unit at Hartlepool Hospital. The Chief Executive apologised for the way the recent communications had come out in relation to the changes at A&E. As part of the process of the changes under Momentum, the hospital had commenced as part of its normal procedures, a consultation with staff in A&E in relation to the staffing changes that would occur during the introduction of the Minor Injuries facility in the new One Life Centre on Park Road.

The Chief Executive commented that the changes were part of the overall strategy to restructure the services in the community, including the key step of transferring minor injury services to the new Park Road facility while maintaining the critical Emergency Services at the Hartlepool Hospital site.

The Chief Executive commented that the consultation with staff had been about the new staffing arrangements that would need to be implemented to facilitate this change. Some staff would transfer to Park Road, some would operate across the two sites, while others would stay at the hospital. There

would be some strengthening of some staffing structures at North Tees Hospital at the same time.

On the new hospital, the Chief Executive stated that the new plan for the new hospital had been affected by the governments announcement not to approve funding, but the Foundation Trust was examining others ways of funding the development. Announcements would be made once this process had been completed.

In relation to some of the press reports about A&E services closing in Hartlepool, the Chief Executive stated that while there were changes being made to the services, there would still be minor injury services, though they would now primarily be provided at Park Road and Emergency Services would still remain at the hospital. The press reports about A&E being provided in porta-cabins were wrong. There had been some brief consideration of using porta-cabins for some admin services on a short-term basis but these had been dropped.

The Member of Parliament for Hartlepool was present at the meeting and addressed the Forum. The MP welcomed the comments from the Chief Executive but did feel that the cancellation of the funding for the new hospital changed matters significantly and he did feel that these changes were premature. The MP considered that closing the A&E provision was speeding up the closure of the Hartlepool Hospital. The MP suggested that what was now being proposed was a substantial variation to service provision and therefore should be subject to a Section 244 Consultation under the NHS Act 2006 or the original Momentum Consultation carried out in 2008 referred to the Regulator for consideration.

Members commented that they did not feel the changes were in the best interests of Hartlepool and were concerned that the separation of the accident and emergency services between two locations would lead to confusion and could lead to people attending the wrong venue which potentially could have dire consequences. The MP added that with a range of venues available to parents in particular as children's services had transferred to North Tees, there was bound to be confusion among the public.

The Medical Director, North Tees and Hartlepool NHS Foundation Trust commented that the North East Ambulance Service were aware of the correct venues for casualties. Essentially those that were conscious, though without major injuries, would be sent to Park Road for assessment and treatment. If there was a need for a patient to be referred on to the emergency unit, then they would be taken there. Communication was important and the Trust would be communicating the changes to the public. The Chief Executive highlighted that the Trust considered that they had consulted on these changes as part of the Momentum Consultation that was carried out in 2008.

Members commented although they recognised being consulted on these changes, they expressed concerns that health services were moving away

from what had originally been proposed in Momentum. There were several concerns expressed at the closure of the full A&E facility at the hospital and the split of the service between the two sites. There was concern that people were in effect being asked to self diagnose to decide which venue they attended. Health representatives did, however, contend, that people had become accustomed quite quickly as to where to take children who were ill, and the Trust had every confidence that people would adapt to the new situation very quickly. There would be experienced well-trained staff at the One Life Centre to deal with 20,000 attendances each year. These services would be closer to the community and were not a replacement of the hospital services, simply a relocation.

There were several representatives from the Save Our Hospital group present at the meeting and with the Chair's permission, they were invited to contribute to the debate. The representatives of the group agreed with the view expressed by the MP that the Trust should put the changes on hold and even put a stop to them completely. There was a view that the cancellation of the funding by the government should put an end to any plans for a new hospital and all the services that had been transferred out of Hartlepool should be brought back to the Holdforth Road site and investment in the facilities there should recommence. Members of the group also feared that Hartlepool's health services were being subsumed into the North Tees services.

The Chair indicated that the MP had suggested that the changes proposed should be referred for further consideration under Section 244 of the NHS Act 2006 and this seemed to be in line with the feeling of the meeting. It would be necessary for the Forum to have details of the consultation that had taken place in 2008 and details of the work that had been undertaken with the Ambulance Trust on arrangements for the new service provision. The Chair also considered that the matter should be brought to the attention of full council.

### **Recommended**

That the Chair be delegated with the authority to explore the submission of a complaint to the Secretary of State (under Section 244 of the NHS Act 2006) regarding the level of consultation undertaken on the proposed changes and that the issue be raised for discussion at Full Council.

## **23. Hartlepool Dental Practice** (*Scrutiny Support Officer*)

The Contracts Manager, York Road Dental Practice outlined the proposal by Hartlepool Dental Practice to move its York Road branch to its existing Victoria Road Surgery. The Victoria Road Surgery is approximately 300 metres away from the York Road site. The relocation is proposed to commence from the 16th August 2010. There were a number of concerns relating to the York Road location, one of which was that the surgery was not Disability Discrimination Act compliant. All of the patients had been informed of the proposed changes and there had been no adverse comments received. The move was seen as being positive for patients and staff who would have the support of the Victoria Road surgery.

Members welcomed the proposals but did comment that the consultation letters had included all past patients as well as current.

**Recommended**

That the changes to the York Road Dental Practice as reported be noted and welcomed.

**24. Service Transformation Project: Long Term Conditions** (*Scrutiny Support Officer*)

The Associate Director of Strategic Planning, North Tees and Hartlepool NHS Foundation Trust introduced the Assistant Director of Community Services, North Tees and Hartlepool NHS Foundation Trust and the Manager for Community Respiratory, North Tees and Hartlepool NHS Foundation Trust who gave a presentation to the Forum on the Momentum Service Transformation Project on Long Term Conditions. The presentation outlined the development of the Community Respiratory Service and the excellent patient and practitioner feedback. The presentation also outlined the Telehealth remote monitoring system which was proving to be an excellent development for both patients and practitioners.

The presentation also addressed end of life issues for patients with respiratory diseases to allow them to make their own choice about important issues such as being able to spend their final days at home with their families.

The presentation was welcomed by Forum Members as being very informative of the developments taking place for the care of patients with long term conditions. Members particularly welcomed the approach to end of life issues to allow people to make their own choices in a dignified manner.

**Recommended**

That the report be noted.

**25. Health of Ex-Service Community: Joint Project Board** (*Scrutiny Support Officer*)

The Scrutiny Support Officer sought a nomination from the Forum for a Member to participate in the Joint Project Board, to be formed as part of the Regional Health Scrutiny investigation into the Health of the ex-Service Community.

**Recommended**

That the Chair, be nominated to the Joint Project Board.

**26. Issues identified from the Forward Plan**

No items.

## **27. Feedback From Recent Meetings of Tees Valley Health Scrutiny Joint Committee** *(Scrutiny Support Officer)*

The Scrutiny Support Officer submitted a report informing Members of the issues discussed at meetings of the Tees Valley Health Scrutiny Joint Committee held since the last meeting of the Health Scrutiny Forum on 22 June 2010.

### **Recommended**

That the report be noted.

## **28. Any Other Business**

### Greatham Clinic

The Chair reported that the NHS Hartlepool Board had accepted the recommendations of the Health Scrutiny Forum in relation to their report into the Suspension of Greatham's Nurse Drop-in Clinic at their meeting of 29 July 2010 and circulated the report presented at the NHS Hartlepool Board meeting for Members to note. This was welcomed and noted by the Forum.

### Alcohol Pricing

The Chair reported that the NHS Hartlepool Board had accepted the recommendations relevant to them, as a result of the Health Scrutiny Forum's investigation into 'Alcohol Abuse – Prevention and Treatment' at their meeting of 29 July 2010. During this meeting the Executive Director for Public Health made representations seeking the Forum's support for the introduction of a minimum price per unit for alcohol. Members commented that due to the major changes in Members of this Forum and without sufficient background detail on the impact of such a proposal it was difficult to support such a move. Some Members commented that a minimum pricing policy would not affect the licensing trade but would affect the supermarket alcohol trade. Members suggested that it may be more appropriate for the Licensing Committee or Cabinet to deal with such a request. The Chair informed the Forum that the 'closing the loop report' on the investigation into the health affects of alcohol abuse would be coming to a future meeting of the Forum and it may be more appropriate to discuss this issue at that meeting. The Chair suggested that until the Forum received the closing the loop report, the Final Report into Alcohol Abuse and any evidence pertinent to minimum price per unit of alcohol be circulated to Members of the Forum.

The meeting concluded at 5.45 p.m.

CHAIR



## HEALTH SCRUTINY FORUM

2 September 2010



**Report of:** Scrutiny Support Officer

**Subject:** PROVISION OF ACCIDENT AND EMERGENCY (A&E) / MINOR INJURIES SERVICES IN HARTLEPOOL - COVERING REPORT

---

### 1. PURPOSE OF THE REPORT

- 1.1 To seek the Forum's views on a suggested 'trial' process for the implementation of the suggested model for the provision of A&E / minor injuries services in Hartlepool.

### 2. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

- 2.1 Members will be aware that at the meeting of this Forum on 3 August 2010 Members, residents and officers from the Foundation and Primary Care Trusts discussed in detail the implementation of proposals for the delivery of a new model for the provision of accident and emergency / minor injuries services in Hartlepool.
- 2.2 During the course of discussions, concerns were expressed regarding the transfer of the minor accidents / injuries services (up to broken bones) away from the University Hospital of Hartlepool to the new One Life Hartlepool centre. These discussions culminated in the delegation of authority to the Chair of the Health Scrutiny Forum to explore the submission of a complaint to the Secretary of State (under Section 244 of the NHS Act 2006) regarding the level of consultation undertaken on the proposed change. It was also agreed that the issue should also be raised for discussion at Full Council.
- 2.3 In exploring the submission of a complaint to the Secretary of State, a potential alternative proposal for the trial implementation of the model came to the attention of the Chair of the Health Scrutiny Forum. The Chair of the Forum felt that this alternative course of action / potential solution should be brought to the Forum for consideration by Members (whilst retaining the ability to submit a complaint to the Secretary of State).

- 2.4 Details of the suggested alternative course of action are as outlined below.

As part of the Momentum: Pathways to Healthcare Programme, arrangements for emergency services have been reviewed that both: move us towards the way of providing services and the new hospital as consulted upon in 2008; and continue to provide safe and high quality care.

- 2.5 The delivery of the new hospital at Wynyard will see a new model of emergency care where patients who need major clinical interventions being treated at the main A&E Department of the new hospital and those who have minor ailments and injuries being treated in Hartlepool at the One Life Centre or at an identical centre being developed in Stockton. With the early availability of the minor injuries facility at One Life Hartlepool it is possible to implement this model earlier. The University of Hospital will continue to be the location for treating those patients requiring major clinical interventions and those who have minor ailments and injuries being treated at the One Life Centre whilst also ensuring safe and high quality care.
- 2.6 The Hartlepool Overview and Scrutiny Committee on 3 August 2010 was presented with an overview of the proposed interim arrangements for providing emergency care until the new hospital opens and a number of concerns were raised.
- 2.7 Recognising those concerns, subsequent discussions between the Trust, Primary Care Trust and representatives of the Overview & Scrutiny Committee have led to an alternative proposal being put forward.
- 2.8 Whilst recognising the need to maintain safe and high quality services for the people of Hartlepool it is proposed that whilst the overall direction of travel remains the same, namely, the separation of the minor and major A&E cases with a view to eventually being treated in different places, that the changes occur over a phased time period to coincide with assurances to the Overview & Scrutiny members that the services work effectively and that the public are able to access them appropriately. In the first instance both minor and major cases would continue to be received at the University Hospital of Hartlepool. Having been able to demonstrate that the revised way of handling minor and major cases within the context of the University Hospital of Hartlepool can be safely and effectively accommodated, then the relocation of the minor cases to One Life Hartlepool could then be considered as another step in the journey towards the eventual new hospital.
- 2.9 In practice this would mean that:
- As now, the more serious cases will go to the University Hospital of North Tees as they have done for the last few years
  - As now, major cases would still report to the University Hospital of Hartlepool at any time of day or night, be it directed by GP or arriving by ambulance.

- Minor cases will report to the University of Hartlepool between the hours of 8am and 12 midnight.
  - For the small number of minor cases that currently present between midnight and 8am these people will be seen by the Out of Hours service or, if necessary directed to the University Hospital of North Tees.
  - Once inside the University Hospital of Hartlepool, people who have a minor injury or accident will be treated within a minor injuries area specially designed and staffed for this work
  - Once inside the University Hospital of Hartlepool, people who have a major illness will be treated within an area specially designed and staffed for this work
- 2.10 It is proposed to introduce these arrangements for a three month trial period from November 2010. This will enable the new service to be fully tested and evaluated prior to the physical relocation of the minor injuries part of the service to the facility available at One Life Hartlepool. During this period the NHS bodies propose to fully engage with the Overview & Scrutiny Committee in the evaluation.
- 2.11 To assist the Forum in considering the viability of this alternative proposal, a presentation will be given at today's meeting by representatives from both North Tees & Hartlepool NHS Foundation Trust and Hartlepool Primary Care Trust. The presentation will cover:
- A full breakdown of the suggested alternative course of action for the trial implementation of the proposed new model for the provision of A&E / minor injuries services in Hartlepool;
  - Scenario(s) for the provision of services and positive outcomes; and
  - Details of proposed publicity / communication for implementation of the new model.
- 2.12 Copies of the slides for this presentation will be circulated prior to the meeting for Members attention.

### 3. **RECOMMENDATIONS**

- 3.1 That Members note the content of this report and presentation and consider if they wish to:-
- i) Accept the suggested alternative course of action as a way forward; or
  - ii) Reaffirm their wish to progress the submission of a complaint to the Secretary of State on the grounds agreed at the meeting held on the 3 August 2010; or

iii) Propose an alternative course of action.

**Contact Officer:-** Joan Stevens – Scrutiny Manager  
Chief Executive's Department – Corporate Strategy  
Hartlepool Borough Council  
Telephone Number: 01429 284142  
E-mail – joan.stevens@hartlepool.gov.uk

## **BACKGROUND PAPERS**

No background papers were used in the preparation of this report.