

AUDIT AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE

AGENDA



Thursday 15 August 2019

at 5.00 pm

**in the Council Chamber,
Civic Centre, Hartlepool**

MEMBERS: AUDIT AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE

Councillors S Akers-Belcher, Black, Hall, Hamilton, Harrison, Loynes and Ward.

Standards Co-opted Members: Mr Stan Cronin and Ms Clare Wilson.

Parish Council Representatives: Parish Councillor John Littlefair (Hart) and Parish Councillor Alan O'Brien (Greatham).

Local Police Representative: Superintendent Alison Jackson.

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

2. TO RECEIVE ANY DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST BY MEMBERS

3. MINUTES

3.1 To confirm the minutes of the meeting held on 25 July 2019 (to follow).

4. AUDIT ITEMS

4.1 Referral from Council – Funding To Any Organisation to Which an Elected Member is Affiliated – Scoping (*Statutory Scrutiny Manager*)

5. STANDARDS ITEMS

No Items.

6. STATUTORY SCRUTINY ITEMS

No Items.



7. **MINUTES FROM THE RECENT MEETING OF THE HEALTH AND WELLBEING BOARD**

No Items.
8. **MINUTES FROM THE RECENT MEETING OF THE FINANCE AND POLICY COMMITTEE RELATING TO PUBLIC HEALTH**

No Items.
9. **MINUTES FROM RECENT MEETING OF TEES VALLEY HEALTH SCRUTINY JOINT COMMITTEE**

No Items.
10. **MINUTES FROM RECENT MEETING OF SAFER HARTLEPOOL PARTNERSHIP**

No Items.
11. **REGIONAL HEALTH SCRUTINY UPDATE**

No Items.
12. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS WHICH THE CHAIR CONSIDERS URGENT**

For information: -

Date and time of forthcoming meetings –

Thursday 22 August, 2019 at 10.00 am – Additional meeting.
Thursday 5 September, 2019 at 10.00 am
Thursday 3 October, 2019 at 10.00 am
Thursday 7 November, 2019 at 10.00 am
Thursday 5 December, 2019 at 10.00 am
Thursday 9 January, 2020 at 10.00 am
Thursday 6 February, 2020 at 10.00 am
Thursday 12 March, 2020 at 10.00 am



AUDIT AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE

MINUTES AND DECISION RECORD

25 JULY 2019

The meeting commenced at 10.00 am in the Civic Centre, Hartlepool.

Present:

Councillor: Ged Hall (In the Chair).

Councillors: James Black, Lesley Hamilton, Brenda Harrison, Brenda Loynes and Barbara Ward.

Co-opted Members: Mr Norman Rollo and Ms Clare Wilson.
Parish Councillors Alan O'Brien (Greatham).

Also Present: In accordance with Council Procedure Rule 5.2 (ii), Councillor Marjorie James was in attendance as substitute for Councillor Stephen Akers-Belcher.
Gavin Barker and Cath Andrews, Mazars.
Michael Houghton, Director of Commissioning Strategy and Development, Hartlepool and Stockton NHS Clinical Commissioning Group.
Alastair Monk, Medicines Optimisation Pharmacist from the North of England Commissioning Support (NECS) Unit.

Officers: Chris Little, Director of Finance and Policy
Noel Adamson, Head of Audit and Governance
Sandra Shears, Head of Finance, Corporate and Schools
Denise McGuckin, Director of Regeneration and Neighbourhoods
Sylvia Pinkney, Head of Public Protection
Joan Stevens, Statutory Scrutiny Manager
David Cosgrove, Democratic Services Team

22. Apologies for Absence

Apologies for absence were received from –
Councillor Stephen Akers-Belcher.
Co-opted Members Mr Stan Cronin, Parish Councillor John Littlefair (Hart) and Supt Alison Jackson.

23. Declarations of Interest

None.

24. Minutes of the meeting held on 27 June 2019

Confirmed.

25. The 2018/19 Financial Report (Including the 2018/19 Statement of Accounts) *(Director of Finance and Policy)*

The Director of Finance and Policy submitted for the Committee's consideration the audited 2018/19 Financial Report which included the 2018/19 Statement of Accounts. The Committee had considered the draft accounts at the previous meeting at which time Members had been advised that there was some uncertainty in relation to national pension issues, which had arisen after the draft accounts were prepared, and how these issues would need to be accounted. On 28th June the Government were denied the right to appeal the previous McCloud judgement and as a result local authorities now need to account for the impact of this decision on the Pension Liabilities disclosed in the statutory accounts at 31st March 2019. It was stressed that this was a national issue affecting all local authorities and was not one that would alter 'the bottom line' of the accounts.

The Mazar's representative addressed the Committee outlining the main issues noted during the audit. The Mazar's representatives paid tribute to the Director and his staff in meeting the now very stringent timetable for producing the accounts and also their assistance during the audit process. From the initial production of the draft accounts, no questions or objections to the accounts had been received from the public.

The Mazar's representative outlined the principle sections of the audit report and particularly highlighted the uncertainties that faced the Council in terms of funding. The use of reserves was also commented upon though it was known that the Council was fully aware of these issues.

The auditors stated that they anticipated issuing an unqualified opinion of the accounts by the end of the month and in line with the statutory timescales.

Members questioned the pensions issue surrounding the McCloud judgement. The Mazar's representative stated this was an age discrimination judgement where a pension scheme had been adjusted to be less beneficial to younger workers and while there would be an increased liability for employers, this would be paid over time. The meeting also discussed reference to a loan from the Combined Authority which it was anticipated would be converted to a grant but the finalisation of that process had not been completed in time for the accounts.

Members added their congratulations to the Director of Finance and Policy and his staff for producing the Statement of Accounts on time and for assuring a balanced budget for the authority. The Director thanked Members for their comments and indicated that the process for the 2020/21

budget had already been commenced with Finance and Policy Committee. One concern the Director had was that Brexit would push many of the central government funding changes that had been expected for 2020/21 further down the road. Members questioned the potential longer term impact on the Council as a viable 'going concern'. The Director stated that the authority had to address the budget gap and using reserves was not a viable option for meeting that gap. The Mazars' representative stated that such a question was not in his mind at this time but if the Council didn't deal with the current budget gap this would become a much bigger issue for future years.

Recommended

1. That the matters raised in Mazars' Audit Completion Report detailed in Appendix A to the report be noted.
2. That the adjustments to the financial statements set out in the Audit Completion Report, and in the report be noted.
3. That the Letter of Representation at Appendix B to the report be noted.
4. That the final 2018/19 Financial Report (Appendix C) be approved for publication before the 31st July 2019 statutory deadline.

26. Letter to Those Charged with Governance - Compliance with Laws and Regulations/ Fraud (Assistant Director, Finance and Customer Services)

The Director of Finance and Policy submitted for the Committee's approval a letter to Mazars from the Chair of the Committee detailing how the committee has complied with the requirements of International Standards for Auditing.

Recommended

That the contents of the letter to Mazars outlining how the activities of the Committee comply with the requirements of International Standards for Auditing be approved. The letter was thereupon signed by the Chair.

27. Internal Audit Plan 2019/20 Update (Head of Audit and Governance)

The Head of Audit and Governance updated the Committee on the progress against the internal audit plan for 2019/20. The report included the recommendations agreed with three schools following their audits and details of the internal audits that had been completed; two of which (Health and Safety and Disabled Facilities Grants) had been given 'Limited' assurance.

Members sought details of the reasons behind the limited assurance audits and these were explained by the Head of Audit and Governance. The principle reasons behind the Health and Safety audit limited assurance focussed on procedures and staffing issues. Action was in place to rectify the issues and two posts had been recruited though it was suggested that the Committee may wish to receive a future update on this key area. The Disabled Facilities Grants limited assurance had focussed around the team having moved internally and a series of actions had been agreed and were being implemented.

In relation to Health and Safety, Members sought assurance that the public had not been at risk and the Head of Audit and Governance assured the Committee that that had not been the case, the issues centred on procedures.

Recommended

1. That the report be noted.
2. That an update report be submitted to the Committee assuring Members that the recommendations agreed following the 'Limited' assurance given to Health and Safety have been complied with.

28. Community Safety Plan 2017-20 (Year 3) *(Director of Regeneration and Neighbourhoods)*

The Director of Regeneration and Neighbourhoods reported that in accordance with the Crime and Disorder Act 1998 and the Crime and Disorder Regulations 2007, the Safer Hartlepool Partnership was required to produce a three year Community Safety Plan setting out how it intended to tackle crime and disorder, substance misuse and re-offending in Hartlepool.

The current Community Safety Plan published in 2017 outlines the Safer Hartlepool Partnership's strategic objectives for a three year period, with a requirement to refresh the plan on an annual basis following completion of the annual strategic assessment. The Community Safety Plan (Year 3) had been agreed by the Safer Hartlepool Partnership on 21 June 2019.

Members discussed the monitoring of the strategic objectives and it was indicated that the regular quarterly reports would still come to this Committee. Concern was also expressed by Members on the statistics around the success rates for the drug and alcohol treatment services in Hartlepool, particularly with the recently announced statistics on drug related deaths which were three times higher than the national average. The Director stated that the statistics were startling and that they were an issue discussed regularly at the Partnership. The Finance and Policy Committee was also considering a report on the future of the drug and alcohol services.

Recommended

The Committee noted the Community Safety Plan (Year 3).

29. Safer Hartlepool Partnership Performance *(Director of Regeneration and Neighbourhoods)*

The Director of Regeneration and Neighbourhoods submitted an overview of Safer Hartlepool Partnership (SHP) performance for Quarter 4 – January to March 2019 (inclusive). Members questioned the increase in reported rapes and asked if this was more offences being committed, which would be concerning, or an increase in the confidence of victims coming forward which would be welcomed. The Director stated that she did not have the details of the statistics but would include them within the next update report.

Recommended

That the report be noted.

30. Tees Valley and Durham Clinical Commissioning Groups – Merger Proposals *(Director of Commissioning Strategy and Development, Hartlepool and Stockton NHS Clinical Commissioning Group)*

The Director of Commissioning Strategy and Development, Hartlepool and Stockton NHS Clinical Commissioning Group (CCG) gave a presentation outlining the reasons behind a review of the CCGs across the Tees Valley and Durham and the recommendations of the CCGs for the future.

The NHS Long Term Plan contains proposals for one Clinical Commissioning Group per Integrated Care System (ICS) area with the creation of 'Strategic' commissioning organisations. CCGs were also required to reduce running costs by 20% and focus on transforming services across providers to provide better outcomes for patients and reduce inequality. The CCG is aware of the need to take a proactive approach to structural change and the potential for change to be imposed by NHS England should a restructure proposal not be submitted.

Following consideration of potential options, the CCG had concluded that on organisation across the whole ICS area (North East and Cumbria) would be unfeasible and were recommending two CCGs, whilst retaining a shared management structure to ensure cost benefits. The two CCG's to cover:

- The Tees Valley (covering Redcar and Cleveland, Middlesbrough, Stockton and Hartlepool); and
- Durham (including Darlington).

Details of the suggested 2 CCG model were currently being presented to Health and Wellbeing Boards and Scrutiny Committees across Durham and the Tees Valley to enable views and comments to be considered by NHS England alongside the CCG proposal. Wider views were also being sought through local Healthwatch organisations.

Members noted the benefits outlined in the presentation to the proposals but questioned what negatives the CCG had identified to the amalgamations across the Tees Valley in particular. The CCG representative stated that the CCGs were still working through the application process set out by NHS England but did not feel there were any significant negatives to the single Tees Valley CCG. Members questioned how Hartlepool would be represented on the new CCG, as they considered that one of the benefits that would be lost to Hartlepool was the input of local GPs which they were concerned would be lost in the wider Tees Valley. The CCG representative stated that how the Governing Body would be constituted had not yet been worked through though there would be a retention of the local focus.

Members discussed the changes at some length, and received clarification that the proposed merger relates to the area across which the CCG plans, buys and monitors the hospital and healthcare services they commission. In terms of services to patients, there would be no changes as a result of the proposals.

The Scrutiny Manager summarised the debate indicating to the CCG that at this time the Committee felt it was not in a position to give a conclusive view on the proposals and would wish to see additional information in relation to the below before a finalised response could be provided:

- Results of the consultation and engagement work being undertaken by Healthwatch and the CCG; and
- Clarification of the configuration of the Governing Body of the new CCG and the potential impact on representation from Hartlepool GP's (specifically if the number of positions would be calculated on a population basis).

Recommended

1. That the presentation and discussions be noted.
2. That no formal response to the consultation be submitted at this stage until Members receive:
 - The results of the consultation and engagement work being undertaken by Healthwatch and the CCG; and
 - Clarification of the configuration of the Governing Body of the new CCG and the potential impact on representation from Hartlepool

GP's (specifically if the number of positions would be calculated on a population basis).

31. Changes to Repeat Prescription Ordering Systems (RPOS) *(Statutory Scrutiny Manager)*

The Medicines Optimisation Pharmacist from the North of England Commissioning Support (NECS) Unit outlined the changes to the repeat prescriptions ordering process that were being introduced across the CCG area to, principally, tackle the issues of drug waste.

It was reported that in each CCG area there was as much as £2m wasted on un-needed or over ordered drugs each year. Many people had defaulted to using their pharmacy to order their repeat prescriptions on their behalf without assessing if they needed all the items. The NHS intended to tackle this waste through changes to the re-ordering processes and by encouraging the use of the digital ordering system for which, a new smart phone app was to be introduced.

The system would change in that repeat prescription orders had to come through GP surgeries and not from pharmacies. Pharmacies were fully aware of the changes and the system had already been adopted in a number of other areas including in the North East. People's access to their prescribed medicines was not being reduced and the systems in place for care home settings would remain in place. Patients that would need support or were considered vulnerable would still be supported.

Members discussed the changes outlined with some indicating that they were already aware of the changes. Members were concerned that the changes could spark an increase in the pressure for appointments with GPs which was already a significant issue in some surgeries. There were also concerns expressed around the help for vulnerable people and the advice being given on the new arrangements by some pharmacies.

Recommended

Members expressed their general support for the new arrangements designed to tackle drug waste in the NHS but requested that an update be provided six months after the commencement of the scheme in Hartlepool to allow Members the opportunity to ascertain how the new procedures had bedded in and where any issues remained.

32. Anti-Social Behaviour Investigation – Scoping *(Statutory Scrutiny Manager)*

The Statutory Scrutiny Manager reported that at the meeting on 27 June Members agreed the investigation topic for the year would be the issue of anti-social behaviour, with the impact of police resourcing and drug / alcohol

misuse forming strands of the investigation. The report set out the aim and terms of reference for the investigation including potential areas of enquiry and sources of evidence and a proposed timetable for Members approval. The Statutory Scrutiny Manager also outlined a proposal to utilise a number of working groups (three were suggested) to facilitate the investigation evidence gathering and consultation.

In debating the aim and terms of reference, Members made the following comments and additions to the terms of reference.

- Some means of identifying costs associated with anti-social behaviour should be considered.
- Comparator trends across the Tees Valley, North East and the CIPFA 'family' of similar local authorities.
- Identifying with different age groups what they defined as anti-social behaviour.
- The impacts of drug abuse in driving anti-social behaviour and how children and young people were being used to move drugs around the town.
- How housing providers were dealing with problem tenants who were drug and alcohol abusers.
- How the courts system impacted on the provision of local services.
- The costs associated with collecting and disposing of discarded drug paraphernalia.
- Adding youth groups / the youth parliament to the consultation list.

The Statutory Scrutiny Manager also outlined a proposal for funding from the dedicated overview and scrutiny budget for the attendance of a Member at an LGA conference on anti-social behaviour in London. The Statutory Scrutiny Manager indicated that the Vice-Chair had expressed an interest in attending the conference and would feed information from it into the investigation. Members suggested that, should it be possible, other members should be given the opportunity to attend.

Recommended

1. That subject to the comments/additions set out above, the remit of the investigation as outlined in the report be approved.
2. That three Working Groups be utilised during the investigation and that the establishment of the working groups be discussed at the next meeting of the Committee.

33. Minutes from the Recent Meeting of the Health and Wellbeing Board

The minutes of the meeting held on 4 March 2019 were received.

34. Minutes from the Recent Meeting of the Safer Hartlepool Partnership

The minutes of the meeting held on 21 June 2019 would be submitted to the next meeting.

35. Any Other Items which the Chairman Considers are Urgent

The Chairman ruled that the following items of business should be considered by the Committee as a matter of urgency in accordance with the provisions of Section 100(B) (4) (b) of the Local Government Act 1972 in order that the matter could be dealt with without delay.

Maternity Services at University Hospital of Hartlepool

The Chair referred to recent press coverage involving the Member of Parliament, Mike Hill, stating that the maternity unit at University Hospital of Hartlepool had been closed and that no births or pre and post-natal services were being delivered from the birthing unit at the hospital.

The Statutory Scrutiny Manager stated that following the investigation report into maternity services and the recommendations agreed by the Committee, work had been ongoing with the Trust on the delivery of those recommendations, particularly the transformation of the maternity unit into a 'Maternity Hub' where all pre and post-natal services would be based. The Trust had been scheduled to give an update on this work to the October meeting.

At this point in time, there was no clarification from the Trust as to what was the current situation at the Hospital and the Statutory Scrutiny Manager suggested to Members that they could request that the Trust attend an earlier meeting of the Committee to update Members on the current situation and the development of the maternity hub.

Members discussed some of the issues around maternity services in Hartlepool and the Statutory Scrutiny Manager undertook to circulate the Maternity Services Investigation Report to Members. Members also suggested that the Member of Parliament's office be contacted to ascertain the details of the issue raised with him.

Recommended

That the North Tees and Hartlepool NHS Trust be invited to an additional meeting of the Committee to be convened at the earliest convenient opportunity to discuss the current provision of maternity services at

University Hospital of Hartlepool and an update on the development of the Maternity Hub at the hospital.

The meeting concluded at 12.10 pm

CHAIR

AUDIT AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE

15 August 2019



Report of: Statutory Scrutiny Manager

Subject: REFERRAL FROM COUNCIL – FUNDING TO ANY ORGANISATION TO WHICH AN ELECTED MEMBER IS AFFILIATED - SCOPING

1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 To inform Members that Council, at its meeting held on the 30th July 2019, made a formal referral to the Audit and Governance Committee in relation to funding of any organisation to which an elected member is affiliated.

2. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

- 2.1 The remit of the Audit and Governance Committee covers a variety of areas. As part of its audit role, the Committee is responsible for ensuring that the Authority has the necessary systems and procedures to manage its budget and finances in a proper and prudent way¹, with a focus on financial governance and stewardship, risk management and audit arrangements.²
- 2.2 Council at its meeting on the 30th July 2019 received the following Motion and, in recognition of the audit role of the Audit and Governance Committee, agreed that consideration of the issues raised be referred to an independently chaired Working Group of the Committee for further investigation.

“Hartlepool’s Labour Councillors request that this Council:

1. Review its decision making procedures around the awarding of funding to any organisation to which an elected member is affiliated in a capacity, such as an employee, trustee or director.
2. Ensures that any organisation in receipt of funding from Hartlepool Borough Council in excess of £1000 in total per annum be subject to stringent processes of auditing and reporting with an additional requirement to submit full accounts, prepared and audited by an independent qualified accountant to Hartlepool Borough Council at the end of each financial year within which local authority funds have been received.
3. Makes known its systems and processes for ensuring and evaluating ‘value for money’ relating to the funding provided to individual organisations and makes public the results of any and all such evaluations on an annual basis.”

Signed: Councillors Howson, Lindridge, C Richardson, Prince and Hamilton.”

¹ Hartlepool Borough Council Constitution - Article 8.1(a)

² Hartlepool Borough Council Constitution - Part 3

2.3 The Audit and Governance Committee is required to consider the referral from Council, as outlined in Section 2.2, and in progressing the referral is requested to discuss and agree the:-

- i) Membership of the Working Group;
- ii) Appointment of an Independent Chair for the Working Group;
- iii) Process for consideration of the referral; and
- iv) Timetable for completion of the investigation (within the required time frame).

3. **MEMBERSHIP OF A WORKING GROUP**

3.1 In establishing the required Working Group, it is recommended that its membership be drawn from the Elected Members and Co-opted Independent Persons currently appointed to the Audit and Governance Committee. Parish representatives should not be included in the membership of the Working Group as they are appointed solely for consideration of Parish related issues.

3.2 Consideration must also be given to any potential conflicts of interest for Members who are affiliated (employee, trustee or director) to organisations that receive Council funding. To assist the Committee in its consideration of this issue, details of Member Declarations are outlined in **Appendix A**, outlining details of:-

- All Member Declarations of Interest;
- Instances where Members have a declared 'pecuniary' interest; and
- Instances where Members have a declared 'non- pecuniary' interest.

3.3 Where the Committee considers that a conflict of interest exists, it is recommended that those Members be precluded from the membership of the Working Group. However, meetings of the Working Group are to open to the public and, as such, contributions from all residents and Elected Members will be welcomed.

4. **APPOINTMENT OF CHAIR**

4.1 In accordance with the wishes of Council, the Committee is required to appoint an independent person to Chair the Working Group.

4.2 In 2017, Hartlepool Borough Council appointed three Independent Person's (IP's) to fulfil its standards responsibilities under the Localism Act 2011. These being Clare Wilson, Norman Rollo (recently resigned) and Stan Cronin. Discussions with these IP's have resulted in receipt of an expression of interest from Clare Wilson to take up the position.

4.2 It is recommended that Clare Wilson be appointed as the Independent Chair of the Working Group.

5. TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR CONSIDERATION OF THE REFERRAL

- 5.1 It is proposed that the Working Group's investigation focus on the questions / proposals contained within the Motion referred from Council (as detailed in Section 2.2 of this report). In identifying the evidence required by the Working Group to progress its investigation, it is suggested that the following evidence be considered:
- How organisations are funded by the Local Authority.
 - Which organisations are funded?
 - The purposes for which funding is allocated.
 - Monitoring arrangements in place to ensure that funding is used for the purpose intended.
 - Risks to the Local Authority.
- 5.2 To assist the investigation details of payments made in the last three years to organisations where members have declared an interest are attached at **Appendix B**. This information has been extracted from the quarterly information published on the Council's website, which exceeds the publication requirements councils are required to meet. The Council's previous decision to publish this level of information was designed to provide clear accountability in relation to this area.
- 5.3 For the purposes of this investigation it is suggested that schools expenditure is excluded, as although a significant number of Members act as School Governors there are specific arrangement regarding how funding is allocated to individual schools. These arrangements mean that key decisions regarding the schools funding formula are discussed at Schools Forum who then make proposals to Children's Services Committee for decision. The formula is applied consistently across all schools in Hartlepool. As Hartlepool follows the National Funding Formula, discretion is limited and there are no decisions made regarding individual schools. .
- 5.4 The involvement of Councillors in school funding decisions is limited to those disapplication decisions which have not been agreed by Schools Forum. In these instances these decisions are made by the Council, in its capacity as the Local Education Authority, which have then been subject to referral to the Secretary of State for final determination. Owing to cuts in funding and service pressures the Council has had to make a number of disapplication requests over the last two years. These have all been approved by the Secretary of State, which confirms the robust business cases presented by the Council.
- 5.5 Members are asked to consider if they have any additions to the proposed focus of the Working Groups investigation, or evidence to be provided (as detailed Section 5.1). Further detailed consideration to be given to the questions to be asked as part of the investigation to be decided at the first meeting of the Working Group. Depending on the number and scope of any additional questions there may be an impact on the proposed timetable, or a requirement to investigate additionally issues separately to avoid delaying the initial investigation referred from Council.

6. POTENTIAL AREAS OF ENQUIRY / SOURCES OF EVIDENCE

6.1 The Committee can invite a variety of people to attend to assist in the forming of a balanced and focused range of recommendations as follows:-

- (a) Signatories of the Motion;
- (b) Director of Finance and Policy and Head of Audit & Governance;
- (c) All Councillors; and
- (d) Members of the Public.

7. PROPOSED TIMETABLE OF THE SCRUTINY INVESTIGATION

7.1 Detailed below is the proposed timetable for the review to be undertaken, which may be changed at any stage:-

Meeting of the Working Group - August - To agree the evidence to be provided, and questions to be asked, as part of the Working Group's consideration of the referral.

Meeting of the Working Group - TBC - To consider evidence and formulate a response to the questions identified.

Meeting(s) of the Working Group - TBC - To agree the Working Groups response to the referral.

Meeting of the Audit and Governance Committee - TBC - To consider the findings of the Working Group and approve for submission to Council

Meeting of the Council – October / November 2019 - To consider the Working Group's Final Report. The report to be presented by the Independent Chair of the Working Group.

8. RECOMMENDATIONS

8.1 That the Committee approve:-

- i) The membership of the Working Group.
- ii) The appointment of Clare Wilson as the Independent Chair of the Working Group.
- iii) The focus of the Working Groups investigation, and the evidence to be provided.
- iv) The process and timetable for completion of the referral.

BACKGROUND PAPERS

The following background papers were used in preparation of this report:-

(a) Council reports and minutes – 30 July 2019

Contact Officer: - Joan Stevens – Statutory Scrutiny Officer
Chief Executive's Department – Legal Services
Hartlepool Borough Council
Tel: 01429 284142
Email: joan.stevens@hartlepool.gov.uk

	Total Count	C Akers-Belcher	S Akers-Belcher	J Brewer	P Brown	B Buchan	J Black	T Cassidy	L Cartwright	T Fleming	L Hamilton	B Harrison	D Hunter	G Hall	H Howson	M James	A Johnson	K King	J Lauderdale	J Lindridge	S Little	B Loynes	A Marshall	S Moore	D Mincher	A Prince	C Richardson	T Richardson		L Smith	C Stokeill	J Tennant	S Thomas	B Ward	M Young		
Employment, Office Trade, Profession or Vocation (1)																																					
Ward Councillor HBC	4								1																	1	1								1		
Holds a Private Hire Badge	1																													1							
West View Project 2015 - 2016	1																															1					
Portals Place 2016 -2017	1																															1					
Citizens Advice Witness Service (Durham Crown Court/Peterlee Magistrate Court/Newton Aycliffe)	1										1																										
Brexit Party Regional Controller	1																																1				
Cleveland Fire Authority	1															1																					
Casual Employee contract at Sunderland University	1																																	1			
Health & Safety Business Partner for the Home Group	1								1																												
Member of The European Parliament for North East England	1																																1				
Elected Member of the Cleveland Fire Authority	2															1																			1		
Healthwatch Manager/ Healthwatch Hartlepool CIO	1	1																																			
Healthwatch Hartlepool Employee	1																																1				
Legacy Learning Trust (North Yorkshire County Council-Employed Senior Financial Consultant)	1						1																														
Pauls Travel	1																				1																
Asda Employee	1																						1														
Customer Services Assistant - Morrisons	1			1																																	
Employee of Paystream MyMax Ltd - HGV Driver	1																							1													
USDAW	1																											1									
Hartlepool Borough Council - Elected Member	1																							1													
Provider of Supported Lodgings for Homeless People	1																			1																	
Darlington CAB	1														1																						
Tata Steel	1																								1												
Olympus Nails Ltd	1				1																																
Self Employed	1		1																																		
Self Employed Accountant	1													1																							
Teacher - Sub-Contractor for various organisations	1							1																								1					
TK MAXX	1																									1											
Jonathan Arnott MEP	1							1																													
Dubway One (Owner)	1				1																																
Retired	1																					1															
Elected Member Rural west Ward	1																					1															
Owner of Liberty Catering Solutions, Liberty for Lunch	1																														1						
Self Employed Consultant	1																																		1		
Pulse Technologies NE Ltd - Director	1																																		1		
Pendrails – Support worker																	1																				

	Total Count	C Akers-Belcher	S Akers-Belcher	J Brewer	P Brown	B Buchan	J Black	T Cassidy	L Cartwright	T Fleming	L Hamilton	B Harrison	D Hunter	G Hall	H Howson	M James	A Johnson	K King	J Lauderdale	J Lindridge	S Little	B Loynes	A Marshall	S Moore	D Mincher	A Prince	C Richardson	T Richardson		L Smith	C Stokeill	J Tennant	S Thomas	B Ward	M Young		
Sponsorship (2)																																					
Hartlepool Constituency Labour Party	1																										1										
Independent Union	1																																		1		
USDAW	1																										1										
The For Britain Movement – Election Expenses (National Spending), No Money received Directly	1																	1																			
Contracts with the Authority (3)																																					
Home to School Transport ITU Hartlepool	1																				1																
Council Sub-Contractor-Catering (no contractual obligation to use)	1																													1							
Supported Lodgings for the Homeless	1																		1																		
Healthwatch Hartlepool	1	1																																			
SUEZ-Elected Director Rep for 4 Ex-Cleveland LA’s – delivers services under contract to all 4 LA’s inc.HBC	1															1																					
Rifty Youth Project – hold Licensing of Rift House Community Building to which volunteer	1		1																																		
Land in the Area of the Authority (4)																																					
11 Chelston Close, Hartlepool, TS26 OPW	1			1																																	
Home within Hartlepool	1																					1															
101 Westbrooke Avenue, Hartlepool	2	1	1																																		
12 Croxton Avenue, Hartlepool	1					1																															
2 Silverbirch Road, Hartlepool	1																														1						
38 De Havilland Way, Hartlepool, TS25 2DW	1												1																								
11 Eamont Gardens, Hartlepool	1													1																							
Home within Hartlepool	1								1																												
2 Tristram Avenue, Hartlepool	1																																1				
36 The Green, Elwick Village, TS27 3EF	1																																		1		
7 Queensland Road, Hartlepool, TS25 1NE	1																					1															
36 Northwold Close, Hartlepool, TS25 2LP	1																																1				
122 Cornwall Street, Hartlepool	1																		1																		
63 Grange Road, Hartlepool	1														1																						
18 Rowell St / Joint Ownership – 8 Lacey Gr, H’pool	1																																	1			
36 Sedgewick Close, Hartlepool	1																																				
3 Alderwood Close, Hartlepool	1											1																									
3 Teesdale Avenue, Hartlepool	1																										1										
61 Intrepid Close, Hartlepool	1						1																														
59 Duke Street, Hartlepool	1										1																										
Home is within the Borough of Hartlepool	1															1																					
42 Dodsworth Walk, Hartlepool	1																																				
47 Caistor Drive, Hartlepool	1																			1																	
7 Banff Grove, Hartlepool, TS25 3DB	1																											1									
2 Barnes Court, Hartlepool	1																	1																			
32 Bilsdale Rd / Pauls Travel Coniston Rd, H’pool	1																				1																
48 De Havilland Way, Hartlepool																	1																				

	Total Count	C Akers-Belcher	S Akers-Belcher	J Brewer	P Brown	B Buchan	J Black	T Cassidy	L Cartwright	T Fleming	L Hamilton	B Harrison	D Hunter	G Hall	H Howson	M James	A Johnson	K King	J Lauderdale	J Lindridge	S Little	B Loynes	A Marshall	S Moore	D Mincher	A Prince	C Richardson	T Richardson		L Smith	C Stokell	J Tennant	S Thomas	B Ward	M Young		
2 Byland Grove, TS25 1EJ (Joint Owner)	1																													1							
64 Elizabeth Way, TS25 2AX (Lessee)	1																													1							
4 Moor Terrace, Hartlepool	1									1																											
Home within Hartlepool	1							1																1													
11 Lime Crescent, Hartlepool, TS24 8JQ	1																								1												
Home in Hartlepool - C20 Allotment Chester Rd	1																									1											
11 Kingfisher Close, Hartlepool, TS26 0GA	1				1																																
Licence to occupy Land (5)																																					
Oxford Road Baptist Church	1																		1																		
Tenant - Former Salvation Army Citadel, Durham St, H’pool	1																																		1		
User 17 The Arches, Hartlepool	1													1																							
Bringing Communities Together, Durham St, H’pool	1																																	1			
Oxford Rd Baptist Church Manse 28 Oakland Ave, H’pool	1																		1																		
Corporate Tenancies (6)																																					
Rift House Community Building	1		1																																		
Home Group	1								1																												
Securities (7)																																					
Incorporated Company - Dormant I Love Hartlepool	1													1																							
Dormant - H East Durham Media	1													1																							
Dormant of We Love Hartlepool Ltd	1													1																							
Trading - Hartlepool Community Broadcasting Ltd	1													1																							
Tony Ampleford - Portals Place, Gavin Wise - Wise Financial Security	1																														1						
Pulse Technologies NE Ltd - 24% not currently 25k or more	1																																		1		
Other Interests (8)																																					
Footlight Youth Theatre	1						1																														
Hartlepool Masonic Lodge- Heugh 7773	1								1																												
Unite Member	1																			1																	
National Museum of The Royal Navy	0																																				
Governor of Sacred Heart Primary School	1													1																							
GMB (Union)	1													1																							
AAT (Professional Body)	1													1																							
Hartlepool Constituency Labour Party	1																										1										
Cuba Solidarity Campaign	1																										1										
British Mensa	1													1																							
Audit & Governance Committee	1													1																							
Dyke House College Academy	1																	1																			
Governor of West Park Primary School	1																					1															
Governor of Greatham CE Primary School	1																					1															
Chairman for Miles for Men, Hartlepool	1																																		1		

	Total Count	C Akers-Belcher	S Akers-Belcher	J Brewer	P Brown	B Buchan	J Black	T Cassidy	L Cartwright	T Fleming	L Hamilton	B Harrison	D Hunter	G Hall	H Howson	M James	A Johnson	K King	J Lauderdale	J Lindridge	S Little	B Loynes	A Marshall	S Moore	D Mincher	A Prince	C Richardson	T Richardson		L Smith	C Stokell	J Tennant	S Thomas	B Ward	M Young
Hartlepool Round Table	1						1																												
Hartlepool Borough Councillor	1	1																																	
Trustee - Victoria & Jubilee Homes	1																		1													1			
Member of Hartlepool United Supporters Trust	1																										1								
Hartlepool Constituency Labour Party	1																										1								
Morning Star Co-Operative Society	1																										1								
Joint Chair of Rift House Residents	1		1																																
Trustee - West View Project Children's & Young Peoples Activity Centre	1																															1			
Public Member of North Tees & Hartlepool F.T	1																															1			
People Press Shareholder	1																															1			
Socialist Labour Party	1	1																																	
Public Member of TEWV	1																																1		
Rift House Residents Association	1	1																																	
Member of The Labour Party	1																																1		
Governor of St Teresa's School	2											1				1																			
Trustee - Henry Smith Educational Charity	1																							1											
Member of The Rifty Youth Project	2	1	1																																
National Association of Councillors	2	1	1																																
Project Co-ordinator for The Rifty Youth Project	1		1																																
Non Remunerated Director-Sustainable Fisheries (Tees Valley), CIC (Part 7 - HBC Constitution)	1																							1											
CECA	1											1																							
Preston Simpson	1											1																							
Sterndale Music Awards Body	1											1																							
Hartlepool Regeneration Group Ltd	1																																1	1	
Public Member of NEAS	1																															1			
Independent Union Treasurer	1							1																											
Cleveland Fire Authority	2															1																		1	
Unison Member	3	1											1				1															1			
SUEZ Teesvalley Director	1															1																			
Northeast Region Employers Organisation & Executive Member	2								1								1																		
USDAW	1															1																			
Unison Women's Officer	1										1																								
LGA - Special interest group	1															1																			
Northumbria Regional Flooding & Coastal Committee	1															1																			
Footlight Theatre	1						1																												
Director Bringing Communities Together Ltd, Hartlepool	2																																1	1	

M Young	B Ward	S Thomas	J Tennant	C Stokell	L Smith		T Richardson	C Richardson	A Prince	D Mincher	S Moore	A Marshall	B Loynes	S Little	J Lindridge	J Lauderdale	K King	A Johnson	M James	H Howson	G Hall	D Hunter	B Harrison	L Hamilton	T Fleming	L Cartwright	T Cassidy	J Black	B Buchan	P Brown	J Brewer	S Akers-Belcher	C Akers-Belcher	Total Count				
Interested Parties (9)																																						
Relative - Teaching Assistant	1																																	1				
Father in Law - employee of HBC	1	1																																				
Father - employee of HBC	1		1																																			
Husband - See C Akers-Belcher Declaration	1		1																																			
Stephen Akers- Belcher (Husband) Councillor	1	1																																				
Husband - Governor (staff) at Jesmond Primary, Teaching Asst of Jesmond Gardens Acadamy	1															1																						
Husband - Employee of Liberty Steel, and a Non-Executive Director of SUEZ Teesvalley	1																1																					
Father in Law - Chair of West View Resource Centre & Vice Chair Lynnfield Governors	1																																		1			
Brother - Chair of Governors (St Josephs)	1																1																					
Partner - See D Hunter Declaration																		1																				
Wife - Primary School Teacher (Greatham) & Governor (Lynnfield Primary)	1																																		1			

Supplier Name	Payments 2016/2017 £	Payments 2017/2018 £	Payments 2018/2019 £	Total £	Member (Current)	Member (Previous)	Type of Interest (as at 1st April 2019)
Asda Stores Limited	-	-	1,323.86	1,323.86	Ann Marshall		Employment, Office Trade, Profession or Vocation
Asylum Seekers And Refugee Group	2,685.00	1,146.50	1,901.00	5,732.50		Paul Beck	Other Interests
Belle Vue Community Sports	104,790.49	302,890.32	325,913.65	733,594.46		Alan Clark Kevin Cranney	Other Interests
Bringing Communities Together	-	-	6,539.07	6,539.07	Michael Young		Employment, Office Trade, Profession or Vocation
Changing Futures North East	93,231.93	115,547.60	-	208,779.53	Gerard Hall		Other Interests
H M S Trincomalee Trust	25,611.11	-	-	25,611.11	Gerard Hall		Other Interests
Hartlepool Access Group	800.00	10,000.00	-	10,800.00		Kevin Cranney	Other Interests
Hartlepool Citizens Advice Bureau	3,150.00	-	4,745.14	7,895.14		Allan Barclay	Other Interests
Hartlepool Families First	182,244.65	141,638.77	-	323,883.42		Paul Thompson	Interested Parties / Contracts with the Authority / Employment, Office Trade, Profession or Vocation
Hartlepool Men's Sheds	1,875.00	-	-	1,875.00		Tom Hind George Springer	Other Interests Other Interests
Hartlepool Seals Baseball Team	-	520.00	-	520.00	Leisa Smith		Interested Parties
Hartlepool United Supporters Club Ltd	150.00	225.00	-	375.00	Stephen Thomas		Other Interests
Healthwatch Hartlepool	68,702.79	20,256.02	106,485.00	195,443.81	Christopher Akers-Belcher Stephen Thomas		Employment, Office Trade, Profession or Vocation / Contracts with the Authority Employment, Office Trade, Profession or Vocation
Jan's Jelly Babies Jelly Tots Childmind	1,822.80	-	-	1,822.80		Trisha Lawton	Interested Parties
Leisa Smith (Liberty Catering Solutions)	-	8,107.30	2,085.60	10,192.90	Leisa Smith		Employment, Office Trade, Profession or Vocation
Linthorpe Community Primary School	-	2,250.00	-	2,250.00	James Black		Employment, Office Trade, Profession or Vocation
National Museum Of Royal Navy Trading Co	-	-	507,815.50	507,815.50	Christopher Akers-Belcher		Other Interests
National Museum of the Royal Navy	-	-	2,797.88	2,797.88	Christopher Akers-Belcher		Other Interests
Oil NRG Limited	322,409.96	-	-	322,409.96	Shane Moore		Employment, Office Trade, Profession or Vocation
Owton Rossmere Community Enterprise Limited	3,844.00	-	-	3,844.00		Allan Barclay	Other Interests
Oxford Road Baptist Church	1,117.20	430.00	210.00	1,757.20	John Lauderdale		Licence to occupy Land
Paul's Travel		-	89,954.00	89,954.00	Sue Little		Employment, Office Trade, Profession or Vocation
Rift House East Residents Association	4,500.00	800.00	-	5,300.00	Christopher Akers-Belcher Stephen Akers-Belcher		Land in the Area of the Authority / Other Interests Land in the Area of the Authority / Other Interests
Royal Engineers Association	-	-	1,050.00	1,050.00		Allan Barclay	Other Interests
Seaton Youth Centre	108,000.00	-	-	108,000.00		Paul Thompson	Other Interests
St Matthew's Hall Committee	2,672.00	2,744.00	-	5,416.00	Gerard Hall		Other Interests
The Rifty Youth Project	3,679.95	6,819.90	9,960.32	20,460.17	Christopher Akers-Belcher Stephen Akers-Belcher	Paul Beck Sandra Belcher	Other Interests Other Interests Employment, Office Trade, Profession or Vocation Other Interests
West View Advice & Resource Centre Ltd	111,740.50	111,428.92	112,715.62	335,885.04	Carl Richardson	Robin Cook	Other Interests Interested Parties
West View Project	393,358.50	37,926.75	32,097.00	463,382.25		Robin Cook	Other Interests
Xivvi Limited	5,400.00	-	-	5,400.00		Paul Thompson	Securities / Employment, Office Trade, Profession or Vocation / Contracts with the Authority
	1,441,785.88	762,731.08	1,205,593.64				