

PLEASE NOTE VENUE

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL AGENDA



Tuesday 2nd January, 2007

at 10.00 a.m.

in Committee Room 'A'

MEMBERS: CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL:

Councillor Barker, Brash, R Cook, Clouth and Lilley.

1. **APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**
2. **TO RECEIVE ANY DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST BY MEMBERS**
3. **MINUTES**
 - 3.1 To confirm the minutes of the meeting held on 11th December 2006 (*attached*).
4. **ITEMS FOR INFORMATION**
 - 4.1 Local Housing Assessment Commission – Appointment of Consultant – *Director of Regeneration and Planning Services and Director of Neighbourhood Services*
 - 4.2 Tender report for Graham Street Car Park Improvement Works, The Headland – *Head of Procurement and Property Services, Neighbourhood Services*
5. **ANY OTHER ITEMS WHICH THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS ARE URGENT**
6. **LOCAL GOVERNMENT (ACCESS TO INFORMATION) ACT 1985**

PLEASE NOTE VENUE

EXEMPT ITEMS

Under Section 100(A)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following items of business on the grounds that it involves the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in the paragraphs referred to below of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985

7. OPENING OF TENDERS

- 7.1 Tenders for the conversion of paper based records into an electronic format –
Director of Regeneration and Planning Services and Chief Solicitor (para 3)

8. ANY OTHER CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS WHICH THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS ARE URGENT

ITEMS FOR INFORMATION

- i) Date of Next Meeting Monday 15th January 2007 commencing at 10.00am in Committee Room 'C'

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL

MINUTES AND DECISION RECORD

11th December, 2006

PRESENT: Councillor Geoff Lilley (in the Chair)

Councillor Frances London.

OFFICERS: Alison Mawson, Head of Community Safety and Prevention
Dave Morton, Transport Services Fleet Co-ordinator
Pauline Newton, Principal Legal Executive
Jo Wilson, Democratic Services Officer

62 APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies were received from Councillor Gerald Wistow.

63 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

None

64. CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 13th November 2006

Confirmed

65. CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 21st November 2006

Confirmed

66 SECURITY GUARD CONTRACT – *Head of Community Safety and Prevention*

PURPOSE OF REPORT

To advise members on the outcome of the process to select a contractor to provide the security guard contract from November 2006 to March 2010.

ISSUE(S) FOR CONSIDERATION

At the Regeneration & Liveability Portfolio meeting held on the 21st April 2006, the Portfolio Holder decided that this contract would be let using a competitive tendering process.

Advertisements for expressions of interest were placed in local, regional and national publications and on HBC, North East Purchasing Organisation and Government website. Thirty one pre-qualification questionnaires were sent out, resulting in twenty expressions of interest being returned.

On 21st August 2006, Contract Scrutiny Panel approved a tender list of 6 contractors comprising:

Chubb Security Personnel Ltd
 NES Services Ltd
 Northern Security Ltd
 Proline Security (UK) Ltd
 Protector Group
 Reay Security Ltd

The 6 contractors were invited to submit tenders, using scoring system of Quality to Price ratio of 60:40 - References, Method statement and Presentation/Interview : Price. Chubb Security Personnel Ltd and Protector Group declined to tender and one tender missed the deadline.

Following the Presentation and Interviews, the scoring matrix was completed and the results were as follows:

	Contractor A	Contractor B	Contractor C
References	1000	890.8	658
Method Statement	2370.9	2694.6	3000
Presentation/interview	2000	1948.6	1972
Price	4000	2520	3720
Total	<u>9370.9</u>	<u>8054</u>	<u>9350</u>

Contract Procedure Rule 10 (vii) states that the contractor with the highest score will be appointed, therefore NES Services Ltd was appointed for the Security Guard Contract 2006-2010.

The contract commenced at 10am on Tuesday 28th November 2006.

DECISION

That the report be noted.

67. OPENING OF TENDERS FOR 3 WHEELCHAIR ACCESSIBLE MINIBUSES – (para 3) – Head of Technical Services

Members were informed that tenders had been invited in respect of the above.

G LILLEY

CHAIR

CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL

2nd January 2007



Report of: The Director of Regeneration and Planning Services
and The Director of Neighbourhood Services

Subject: LOCAL HOUSING ASSESSMENT COMMISSION –
APPOINTMENT OF CONSULTANT

1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 To update the panel on the appointment of consultants to undertake the Hartlepool Local Housing Assessment and to advise of the successful tenderer.

2. BACKGROUND

- 2.1 The Contract Scrutiny Panel on 30th October 2006 agreed to the recommendation that all consultants who submitted pre-qualification questionnaires should be issued with a full project brief. This took place and five full tender submissions were received by the deadline of the 30th October 2006 at 4pm and were opened and recorded by the Panel at its meeting on Monday 13th November 2006.

3. PROPOSALS

- 3.1 All five consultants were invited to give a presentation and answer 15 pre-set questions. The interview panel consisted of 5 Council officers. Each consultant was marked on presentation and questions and those marks were entered into a score matrix. References for each were also requested and evaluated within the matrix. The score was based on a 60% performance/ 40% price ratio. The matrix demonstrates and it was agreed by all officers that abraDCHR presented the best overall package and they were appointed on the 4th December 2006. The score matrix is attached for information as **Appendix 1**.

4. RECOMMENDATIONS

- 4.1 That the Panel note the decision to appoint abraDCHR to undertake the Hartlepool Local Housing Assessment.

5. REASONS FOR RECOMMENDATIONS

- 5.1 The price/performance score matrix demonstrates that abraDCHR were the successful tenderer based a higher score at interview, references and a competitive price.

6. CONTACT OFFICER

Amy Waters
Planning Officer
Department of Regeneration and Planning
Planning Policy Section
Hartlepool Borough Council
01429 523539
amy.waters@hartlepool.gov.uk

APPENDIX 1

CONTRACT: **Hartlepool Local Housing Assessment (LHA)**

Price/Performance Score Matrix


:

Date 02/01/2007

Category	References			Presentation & Interview			Pricing/ highest price			Total
Name of Contractor Weight	Score from Questionnaire	% of Highest Score	Best Value Score mark out of 10	Score from Interview Matrix	% of Highest Score	Best Value Score mark out of 50	Price of questionnaire per household based on highest sample from each	% of Lowest Price	Best Value Score mark out of 40	mark out of 100
David Cumberland	84%	93	9.3	706	100	50	1.35	100	40	99.3
Ecotec	78%	87	8.7	600	85	42.5	2.25	60	24	75.2
Fordham	91%	100	10	576	88	44	1.46	92.5	37	91
Savills	none	none	0	642	88.4	44.2	4.75	28.4	11.48	55.68
Outside	91%	100	10	587	80.92	40.5	1.6	84.4	33.76	84.26

Completed By:

Signed



Agreed By:

Signed



CONTRACT SCRUTINY PANEL

2nd January, 2007



Report of: The Head of Procurement and Property Services
Neighbourhood Services

Subject: Tender Report for Graham Street Car Park
Improvement Works, the Headland

1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

To advise members of the panel of the outcome of the Graham Street Car park Improvement Works tendering procedure, as administered by Hartlepool Borough Council's Landscape Architecture Design Consultancy and opened by the Contract Scrutiny Panel on 13th November

2. BACKGROUND

This report provides the required audit trail of the Graham Street Car Park tendering procedure.

Tenders were received from all four contractors approached. These contractors are from the select contractor list.

The lowest tender sum received was £43,483.37 from Brambledown Landscape Services and this was accepted.

3. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The accepted tender is within budget.

4. RECOMMENDATIONS

That the Panel receives this report for information.